Community Service in Higher Education

A concept paper

Helene Perold and Rahmat Omar

CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The term `community service' is increasingly being used in discussions and debates throughout South Africa. This concept paper was developed to gain some clarity about the role of community service in higher education and to stimulate informal debate around thus issue.

`Community service' as used in this paper, is defined in broad terms as:

> *programmes linked to higher education that involve participants in activities designed to deliver social benefits to a particular community in ways that teach the participants to work jointly towards achieving the common goal. Participation in community service usually involves a degree of personal sacrifice in terms of time, remuneration and convenience.*

This approach to community service is captured in the matrix on page 108 as opportunities for earning, learning and community commitment. This definition is broad enough to include programmes that are voluntary or compulsory, programmes that involve youth or adults, and those that provide some form of payment or no payment. It encompasses activities as diverse as general volunteer activities which do not require specific levels of skill or knowledge, and activities related to community outreach or extension services which demand different levels of knowledge and skills at higher education level, such as the many law clinics operating on South African campuses. But the definition also excludes certain types of activities: for example, employment in the civil service, per se, is not community service or national service. This definition also excludes programmes whose primary purpose is job training or placement and which are designed to serve their participants rather than the community (such as placements in engineering, discussed in section 2).

Within the ambit of this broad definition, this concept paper attempts to illuminate and focus the discussions and debates about community service by,

- Exploring what is meant by `community service' and how its purpose is understood;

- Providing initial descriptions and analyses of a number of existing projects or programmes in higher education in South Africa;

- Describing some models used in other countries and drawing out the main trends in the international context;

- Drawing out similarities and differences between the experience of community service in South Africa and other countries;

- Exploring community service in the context of higher education; and

- Providing preliminary conclusions.

EXAMPLES OF COMMUNITY SERVICE PROGRAMMES IN SOUTH AFRICA

Little empirical research or evaluation of existing community service programmes has been done in South Africa and the research team had to undertake its own investigation between July and August 1997. The information provided in this concept paper is based on interviews conducted with the organisations involved. The information base may be sketchy and incomplete, but the research has provided some insights which may take the debate forward.

The paper provides an initial description and analysis of the programmes under five categories: student volunteer service programmes; workstudy programmes on and off campus; community outreach and extension services; curriculum-related programmes; and internships/placements.

Volunteer service programmes

Volunteer service programmes treat service as an extra-curricular activity, carried out during vacations or outside tuition time. The current emphasis is on student involvement in general tasks, rather than those specifically related to their field of study: thus no academic credit is provided. Financial aid is provided in some cases, but this is relatively small. These programmes are funded mainly by donors and through student fundraising. The programmes tend to be small in scale and have a loose relationship with the higher education institution that hosts them. Their small-scale

nature limits them to a marginal role in a context where the scale of need is great in terms of service and human resource development.

Workstudy programmes

Workstudy programmes on campus involve students in tasks and activities at different levels, each requiring greater expertise and experience (for instance as assistants in administrative, teaching, library, research, laboratory and technical activities as well as providing services to students on campus). There are certain work categories (such as cleaning, technical maintenance, gardening and canteen duties) for which students are not employed. This is to avoid displacing workers and is a response to negative perceptions of menial work.

While the main goal of the programmes is to provide financial assistance to needy students, two other goals have informed their design - student development and institutional capacity building, particularly in the case of historically disadvantaged institutions. These goals, together with concerns about capacity to run off-campus projects, have determined the on-campus focus of these programmes.

Off-campus workstudy programmes take the form of off-campus placements, mainly in advice offices, research and nongovernmental organisations. They involve students and staff in tasks related to research, administration, publicity work, teaching or tutoring and liaising with parliamentary portfolio committees.

In one of the programmes surveyed a contract is drawn up for each participant, specifying arrangements, responsibilities and obligations. Students work for 90 hours as academic interns or community interns and are given a living allowance as well as part payment on their student fee accounts, which are made only once the work required has been completed.

Community outreach/Extension services

These programmes were initiated within higher education institutions, either as department/ faculty initiatives or as institution-wide initiatives. Students and staff are involved in activities and tasks that require the specialised knowledge and skills of their particular academic disciplines and sometimes involve interdisciplinary or multidisciplinary activities. In most cases recognition is given, either in the form of academic credit or in the form of research publications. In some cases practical support and services for local communities flow out of the teaching and research activities.

These programmes draw their financial support from a number of sources - including contributions by the institution, support from parastatal institutions, private sector grants or foreign donor support. These activities are seen as directly related to the mission of higher education in terms of a commitment to quality teaching, scholarship and research which is responsive to the developmental needs of society. Responsiveness to societal needs in this approach is expressed through the main functions of higher education (teaching, scholarship and research).

This contrasts sharply with the approach that sees `community service' as a distinctive, third leg of higher education's mission (along with teaching and research). With the latter approach, responsiveness to societal needs can become an add-on activity, peripheral to the main functions of teaching and research. However, in both approaches, service delivery is not seen as a distinctive function of higher education.

Although these are distinct programmes they involve the higher education institution in a more enduring relationship with specific communities. The link between these programmes and the mainstream activities of higher education institutions has the potential to transform relationships between higher education and the broader society.

Curriculum-related programmes

Curriculum-related programmes in this paper refer to internships integrated into the curriculum which have been a feature of mainstream professional education for many years. The primary purpose is related to learning and skills development (to supplement academic learning with some form of experiential learning) rather than financial assistance or provision of services to the community.

These programmes take the form of community service in governmental or nongovernmental organisations, or they take the form of placements in particular workplaces or organisations as a course requirement. These activities have traditionally been associated with professional disciplines, such as teaching, engineering and medical technology among others. The number of placement positions available may limit the number of students who can be registered for these courses. For some students, these placements have generated positive experiences, but for many the lack of supervision means that students do not gain as much as expected from the experience.

Placements

Internship has for many years been a feature of mainstream teaching in higher education institutions. It integrates practical or experiential learning into the curriculum, but traditionally does not aim to provide service to a community or to the organisation in which the student is placed as a primary or secondary goal. Placements are a requirement of the course and their primary purpose is skills development for individual students. These programmes provide a mixture of academic and experiential learning and help to improve the work preparedness of graduates. However, in the face of financial difficulties faced by higher education institutions and rationalisation measures introduced by employers, placements and internships have become increasingly difficult to organise on a large scale. The number of students who can be admitted to these courses is limited in some cases by the number of internship positions available. Placements of interns in this category are not regarded as a form of community service in this study.

A SURVEY OF SERVICE PROGRAMMES IN NINE COUNTRIES

A number of developing countries have introduced national service programmes for higher education students to address skills shortages and national development needs. On the basis of available literature nine programmes were studied: Botswana, Costa Rica, Ghana, Indonesia, Israel, Mexico, Nepal, Nigeria and the USA. Seven of these programmes are compulsory national programmes and two are voluntary national programmes (Israel and the USA).

Although the programmes surveyed may have changed in the past five years, and details of the analysis may not be current, the international experience provides useful lessons for South Africa and forms a basis for the comparisons made in section 4.

An analysis of the stated goals of the programmes shows that they address, or seek to address, a number of complex, interrelated goals. National development, unity and the development of civic commitment is one category of goals which most of the programmes share. Other goals are to bring the university closer to the community, to improve curricula and to enhance students' learning through opportunities for practical experience and personal growth.

Deployment: In seven of the nine countries surveyed service was, or is, compulsory and the service period ranges from 150 hours to two years. Participants in the service programmes studied generally do not have any choice in where they are sent or in which projects they participate, and a continuing issue has been students attempting to influence decisions on their deployment. In the two voluntary programmes studied, one is undertaken by students during their studies; the other provides a range of community service opportunities, some of which are aimed at potential higher education students, others at students in institutions and others at graduates.

The literature indicates that the reality of compulsory service is often more complex than is initially anticipated: in many countries programmes may not, in practice, include every student because of lack of financial resources to operate the programmes and/or corruption or cheating in programme requirements.

In programmes where students undertake community service during their studies, the policy on payment varied from statutory prohibition of payment (eg. in Costa Rica) to payment of stipends at the level of a subsistence wage (eg in Nepal). In programmes deploying graduates, as in Ghana or Nigeria, graduates were generally paid less than their expected earnings in nonservice positions. In the Americorps programme, graduates receive a modest living allowance and health cover during the programme and earn an education award after completing their service which can be used towards paying off student loans or financing further studies.

The national service programmes surveyed were organised and managed in different ways, but were all national in their orientation. In some countries government initiated, organised and supervised the service programmes, either centrally or by devolving operational responsibility to state secretariats within a clear national framework. In other cases government provided the resources and a framework of national priorities, but left the management and supervision to a statutory agency or to higher education institutions individually.

Most of the programmes surveyed were financed by government - even those managed and administered by higher education institutions. By contrast, the Americorps programme is supported through contributions from the public, private and independent sector. Government support for all programmes, both compulsory and voluntary, has been influenced considerably by fluctuations in the economy and periodic cutbacks in the national budget.

Constraints experienced by service programmes included student resistance, limited and irregular funding, insufficient placements for effective service, ineffective supervision and unevenness of quality and programme design across higher education institutions in the same country. Furthermore students sometimes lacked identification with the community problem and the necessary methodological skills to apply knowledge in the community. Finally, the choice of directing government resources to students rather than unemployed youth or adults led to tensions.

The literature indicates that the impact on social and national development needs has been difficult to establish since the few evaluations which have

been done do not provide quantitative data and their claims are often unsourced. Claims concerning the impact of national service programmes should therefore be treated with caution. However, on the basis of available evidence they argue that service programmes have: boosted the pace of rural infrastructural development (Nigeria); significantly increased rural school enrolments and literacy levels and improved living conditions (Nepal); made `substantial' contributions to rural welfare and development in medicine (Mexico); helped to deliver the national health service plan by providing qualified personnel for permanent and mobile clinics in the rural areas (Nigeria); delivered direct and measurable results in the areas of education, public safety, human needs and the environment (Americorps); and served as an important feedback mechanism for university planners, teachers and government in respect of rural needs (Nepal).

CURRENT DEVELOPMENTS IN SOUTH AFRICA

The best-known experience of national service in South Africa was compulsory military conscription into the South African Defence Force under the apartheid system. This form of national service has become associated in the minds of many South Africans with political repression and militaristic tendencies. The experience has discredited the idea of national conscription and has left a legacy in which the concept of compulsory conscription is often viewed with suspicion. However, recent developments emerging from civil society and government attempt to give new meaning and form to the notion of national service. The shift in terminology from `national service' to `community service' is indicative of these developments.

The National Youth Service Initiative, established by the National Youth Development Forum in 1993, sought a new approach. It rejected any association with the military, located itself squarely within a reconstruction and development agenda and tried to shift emphasis from notions of conscription of youth in militaristic 'corps' to mobilising young people to participate voluntarily in programmes designed to meet identified social needs in the communities in which they lived. The initiative sought to design programmes which could simultaneously address the education, training and development needs of youth and secure their involvement in

service activities contributing to national reconstruction and development. In spite of many problems in implementation, one of the initiative's significant contributions was that it attempted to infuse the notion of national community service with a developmental, rather than a destructive, militaristic orientation.

Debates about redefining the concept of community service have also been integrated more closely into debates about the transformation of higher education. Youth and student organisations have expressed concern about the need to develop strategies whereby students in need of financial aid can be assisted to gain access to higher education.

The South African Students' Congress resolved at its annual congress in 1996 to lobby for compulsory community work for all higher education students. Its proposal is that community work for higher education students should be linked with what they are studying and should be a prerequisite for completing their courses. Additional community work could be performed by students in return for fee concessions.

The National Youth Commission's activity report of July 1997 contains proposals for a voluntary national youth service programme with the aim of `integrating young people into the economy' and `finding synergies between the need for young people to develop skills and a work ethic and the need for communities to be serviced'. More specifically, the National Youth Commission has proposed a community service programme targeting young people in higher education as a `creative way of financing higher education'.

Various government line ministries are developing proposals which aim to overcome skill shortages and improve the provision of services in underserved communities. The best-known examples here are the community service proposals for medical and law graduates. Proposals are also being made for the design of human resource development programmes which are more responsive to societal priorities. These strategies include attempts to conceptualise the role of placements and internships for undergraduates and graduates in ways that will address multiple goals, including meeting skills shortages, integrating experiential learning into the higher education curriculum, enabling graduates to meet new requirements for professional registration and providing employment

opportunities for graduates. The proposals have generated intense debate about their purpose, nature and implementation.

CONCLUSIONS

On the basis of the research and the analysis, the concept paper draws six conclusions about community service in South Africa:

- Community service is a feature of many higher education strategies which are seeking to respond to societal needs;

- The primary beneficiaries in most of these programmes are the institutional stakeholders: students and staff;

- Increasing the scale and impact of community service activity depends on establishing a strategic match between resources and needs;

- If community service is to make a major impact on social need in South Africa, a quantum leap is required from the fragmented services provided. The challenge is to develop a coherent system which accommodates diversity while putting in place incentives and measures to promote responsiveness to national development priorities;

- External funding is critical for the development and growth of these initiatives; and

- Student financial aid strategies could be boosted by community service.

The paper also identifies areas for further research.

SECTION ONE

INTRODUCTION

'Community service' is a term which is being widely used in discussions and debates taking place throughout South Africa. This concept paper was developed to gain some clarity about the role of community service in higher education in South Africa, and to stimulate informed debate around this issue.

Proponents of community service argue that the concept can contribute significantly to several issues facing higher education. Some see it being able to affect student financial aid. Others believe that it can assist in changing and improving the curriculum to make it more responsive to national, regional and local community development needs. And some argue that through community service, students can improve their employment prospects.

It may also be argued that participation in community service programmes holds direct benefits for a number of stakeholders in higher education. For example:

- Students are probably the main beneficiaries - they acquire work-related skills, earn money and contribute to the provision of services to communities;

- Academics have an opportunity to develop links with society, develop new ways of teaching and researching, and acquire consultancy opportunities - all of which improve the case for the continued public and private support of financially beleaguered higher education institutions;

- Employers will have the opportunity to improve their pool of potential employees, influence the curricula to develop the kinds of skills they requite to become more competitive, and gain access to emerging knowledge;

- Poor communities may get the chance to leverage funding from government or private sector donors for community service programmes and may get access to some services, even if they are of uneven quality and may have little impact on eradicating poverty; and

- Government can influence the training of professionals and public servants needed for the new South African dispensation, make inputs into higher education curricula, and gain credibility for a progressive and socially responsible approach to human resource development.

The call for a comprehensive community service programme in higher education has emerged most vocally among youth and student organisations. For example, at its annual congress in 1996, the South African Students' Congress (Sasco) resolved to lobby for compulsory community, work for all tertiary students. `Such work should be directly linked with what they were studying, and should be a prerequisite in order to complete their degree/diploma. Additional community service could be performed by students for fee concessions.' Along similar lines, the National Youth Commission proposes a programme targeting young people at universities as a `creative way of financing higher education'. The thrust of the proposal is that young people who cannot afford the expense of tertiary education should `collect credits by spending a certain amount of time in community service'. Both youth and student organisations see community service as a way of providing communities with services which will further their development, while simultaneously creating students who are more conscious of the country's development needs and of their responsibility as citizens. They are also concerned with finding strategies whereby students needing financial aid can be helped to access higher education by doing community service in lieu of fees.

More recently an approach to human resource development began emerging in different line ministries which shows growing commitment towards diversifying the skills base so as to meet the developmental goals being set within the different sectors. There is also growing interest in relating people development, teaching and learning to the world of work, to social and community development, and to achieving national and provincial needs. These trends provide new impetus for developing a service ethos in human resource development.

For example, the Department of Welfare comments that `there is an overreliance on professional social workers and there is a need to expand human resource capacity through the employment of other categories of social service personnel such as child and youth care workers, community development workers, social development workers and volunteers.[1] The department also stresses the importance of building a culture of voluntarism in community work and seeks to relate this to academic endeavour.

In Vision 2000, a strategy tabled recently in Parliament, the Ministry of justice spelled out its focus on programmes which aim to increase access to justice and which, among others, target children. In this regard the ministry is devising strategies to meet specific human resource needs such as restructuring the training of legal professionals to meet developmental goals and to strengthen the paralegal movement, including the training of advice office workers and the training of paraprofessionals in alternative dispute resolution procedures. [2]

The Department of Health's emphasis on primary health care has already led to a reorientation of the academic curriculum for doctors, nurses and paramedical staff. The training of nurses, in particular, is acquiring a stronger focus on community need and community involvement: `We are trying to move our nurses at basic training level away from a hospital-based setting into a community-based one, ideally with a 50/50 split'[3]

Higher education institutions, too, are seeking ways of becoming more responsive to the development needs of society through teaching, learning and research programmes which contribute to the advancement of all forms of knowledge and scholarship within the context of local, regional and national development needs. (See section 6 for a detailed discussion)

[1]White Paper for Social Welfare, chapter 4, section 8, p.23.

[2]Information gained in a meeting held by members of the research team with the Ministry of justice planning unit on 23 July 1997.

[3]A spokesperson for the Wits University nursing department, quoted in the Sunday Independent of 27 July 1997.

However, while the concept is eliciting greater interest in South Africa, it is unclear what is meant by `community service'. The term evokes an ideal without defining it sufficiently closely. For example:

- Would community service be compulsory, entirely voluntary or encouraged by government? If voluntary, what incentives would be used to induce service?

- Would community service be applied only to students?

- In higher education would community service apply to all students, or only to students in certain disciplines or only to students in need of financial aid?

- How long would service last?

- Would it involve work that prepared participants for jobs or would they perform only tasks that do not compete with those undertaken in the job market?

- Would participants be compensated, and if so at what level?

Even more fundamental is the need to agree on the larger value or purpose of community service.

- Is it intended as a means of securing financial aid for students in higher education or is it a way of getting students to repay society for the opportunity of higher education?

- Is it intended to meet skills shortages and extend the provision of social programmes; to create jobs for the unemployed; or is it a way of reorganising learning by supplementing classroom education with work experience?

Community service may have all these goals, but they are not always mutually compatible. This raises the question of how the purpose of community service is to be assessed, whatever its design.

The lack of specificity about the nature and purpose of community service generates broad support for the ideal, but inhibits the close examination of the benefits and problems that may characterise different types of service. A further problem is the lack of empirical research and social

science literature on the experience of community service in South Africa. As a result, the debate takes place at a level o£ generality which inhibits serious analysis of the different forms and purposes of community service. In this concept paper the research team has tried to avoid these pitfalls by clarifying the conceptual boundaries of the terms `community', `service' and `community service'.

Conceptual boundaries

Conceptions of community vary from programme to programme. In some cases the term `community' refers to the campus community while in other cases it refers to poor or disadvantaged communities in a particular local area. In their efforts to become more responsive, higher education institutions are also using the term `community' to refer to societal need more broadly.

The concept of service can be delineated in three different ways:

- The first refers to service as a mainly free and voluntary activity through which humanitarian assistance or relief is provided to the needy. This conception can also be defined as welfare. It is sometimes criticised as amounting to charity or `do-gooding' as it emerges from a strong sense of moral obligation rather than contributing to a larger and more systematic effort to eradicate poverty. Examples of this type of programme have been discussed in section 2 under the heading `Student volunteer service programmes';

- The second refers to activities undertaken in the service of a greater cause or ideal, such as religion or nationalism, and involves participants either through appeals for voluntary participation or through compulsion in the form of conscription. The most commonly known form of service in this category is national service programmes which have emerged in many post-colonial or post-revolutionary situations where the new state has emphasised the need for accelerated social and national development. The service activities are carried out within a strict moral or legal code of conduct. Examples of thus category of service have been described in section 3 which focuses on international models of national service programmes in countries such

as Nigeria, Indonesia, Nepal, Mexico, Costa Rica and others. These programmes are said to have had a significant impact on national development and have usually occurred in situations where strong governments have been able to intervene in direct ways. They are characterised by a highly centralised form of organisation, driven and funded by the state. Despite problems encountered in implementation, they have succeeded in extending the provision of services on a large scale; and

• The third conception of service is that of a professional, structured relationship where expert service is provided for a fee, usually within a contractual framework of accountability. These could include services provided by qualified professional practitioners, functioning in the public or private sector as employees, individual practitioners or consultants. The definition of community service used in this paper excludes this type of activity since it flows from the employment contract. As noted above, approaches to human resources development within several ministries are increasingly focusing on forms of community service within particular professional disciplines.

Definition of community service

`Community service' is defined in broad terms as:

programmes linked to higher education which involve participants in activities designed to deliver social benefit to a particular community and which teach the participants to work jointly towards the achievement of the common goal. Participation in community service usually involves a degree of personal sacrifce in terms of time, remuneration and convenience.

This approach to community service is captured in the matrix on page 106 as opportunities for earning, learning and community commitment. This definition includes programmes that are voluntary or compulsory, programmes that involve youth or adults, those that provide some form of payment and those that provide no payment at all. It encompasses activities as diverse as general volunteer activities which do not require specific levels of skill or knowledge (eg. Southern African Student Volunteers' Association environmental projects), as well as activities related to community outreach or extension services which demand

different levels of knowledge and skill at higher education level (eg. the many law clinics which operate on South African campuses).

However, the definition also excludes certain types of activities. For example, employment in the civil service, per se, does not constitute community service or national service. While there is an emphasis emerging within government departments about a service orientation or a `culture of service', this is different from community service as defined above since the service orientation is required in terms of the contract of employment.

This definition also excludes programmes whose primary purpose is job training or placement and which are designed to serve the needs or interests of individuals (eg. placements in engineering, discussed in section 2) rather than the needs of the broader community. Benefits to the community may result from such activities, but are essentially secondary to the benefits gained by the individuals concerned.

Objectives of this paper

Within the ambit of our definition, this concept paper attempts to deepen the discussion about community service and to illuminate and focus the emerging debate by:

- Exploring what is meant by the term `community service' and how its purpose is understood;

- Providing initial descriptions and analysis of a number of existing projects or programmes in higher education;

- Describing some models used in other countries and drawing out the main trends in the international context;

- Drawing out similarities and differences between the experience of community service in South Africa and other countries;

- Exploring the relationship of community service with higher education; and

- Concluding that: community service is a feature of many higher education strategies; that the primary beneficiaries are students and

staff; that increasing the impact of community service activity depends on achieving a strategic match between resources and needs; that the challenge is to develop a coherent system which accommodates diversity while promoting responsiveness to national development priorities; that external funding is critical for the development of these initiatives; and that student financial aid strategies can be boosted by community service.

SECTION TWO

COMMUNITY SERVICE IN HIGHER EDUCATION:

AN ANALYSIS OF SOUTH AFRICAN COMMUNITY

SERVICE CASE STUDIES

The lack of empirical research and social science literature on the experience of community service in South Africa has already been noted. To ground this concept paper in a clearer understanding of the community service programmes being run in the higher education sector, the research team undertook a limited scan of the field in July and August 1997.

A number of higher education institutions were contacted by a team of researchers and efforts were made to tap the experience of technikons as well as universities, historically advantaged as well as historically disadvantaged institutions, and institutions based in urban as well as rural areas. Institutions, organisations and individuals were asked to identify projects that involved students and/or staff in experiential learning, particularly through community-based activity. The research team then developed a framework of required information to guide the field workers. The field workers gathered the data through site visits, interviews with key project personnel and reviewing written material on the various projects. A brief profile of each project was developed from the data and these are included in the appendix.

The research team chose a sample of these programmes for further investigation and analysed the information according to the following categories: goals; programme design; programme operation; scale of the programme; what proportion of the need is addressed; participants (who are the doers? eg. students and staff; intended beneficiaries (members of the community, patients, students who use the library, etc); programme costs; programme financing; to what extent the programmes require the special inputs of higher education; why the programmes were initiated

and by whom; programme partners; institutional support provided; the relationship between the programme and the curriculum and whether or not academic credit is given; whether or not participants are paid, and to what extent this payment assists students in meeting their financial obligations.

An initial scan of the identified programmes showed that they could be divided into a number of categories:

•   Those that take place before higher education, during higher education and after higher education. This analysis has focused on projects that take place during and after higher education;

•   Programmes could also be divided into those that are mainly intended to provide financial support for students; those that are mainly intended to amplify the higher education curricula in different fields of study; and those that are mainly intended to build a greater sense of community commitment among the participants;

•   The nature of the programmes could be classified into five broad categories: those involving students in volunteer service programmes; workstudy programmes on or off campus; extension services or community-outreach programmes; curriculum-related programmes; and those in which students served internships or practica; and

•   When considered through the lens of `service', the programmes constitute points on a continuum, distinguished primarily by their goals and the extent to which the goals are defined explicitly in terms of service. The analysis in this report thus refers to different types of service, eg. volunteer service programmes, community outreach and extension services, national service, etc. Some programmes (such as those involving placement in the workplace) do not constitute community service as defined in the introduction. Nevertheless they are briefly discussed below because they are located at one end of the continuum and provide a useful reference point in assessing the other programmes

The analysis and observations that follow are based on the outcome of this short research process. Given the limited time available for this project, the information base is sketchy and somewhat incomplete, but the research team believes that some of the main trends have been identified. Should

there be a serious interest in community service, it is recommended that further research, analysis and evaluation be undertaken so as to document current practice. The higher education institutions are well-placed to assist in this work, and a range of funders may be interested in supporting these efforts.

1. STUDENT VOLUNTEER SERVICE PROGRAMMES

2. Overview of findings

Student volunteer service programmes treat service as extra-curricular activity, carried out during vacations or outside tuition time. The emphasis is on student involvement in general tasks, rather than those specifically related to their field of study, therefore no academic credit is provided. Financial aid is provided in some cases, but this is relatively small. Participants live at home or in residence at the institutions where they study. These programmes are funded mainly by donors and through student fundraising. The programmes tend to be small in scale and have a loose relationship with the higher education institution which hosts them. Such programmes may be appealing because participation is voluntary, they are modestly intrusive on the time of participants, require relatively low levels of administration and are able to respond directly to local issues. Their small-scale nature limits them to a marginal role in a context where the scale of need is great, both in terms of service and human resource development.

Features of the programmes surveyed

The research process surveyed the activities of four student volunteer service programmes: the University of Pretoria-based Southern African Student Volunteers' Organisation (Sasvo), the University of Cape Town's Students' Health and Welfare Centres Organisation (Shawco), the Ujima Fundraising Organisation based at the University of Cape Town (Ufundo) and the University of Stellenbosch Clinics Organisation (Uskor). On the basis of the information collected in this short research period, four features have been identified. They are examined below.

Most of the programmes are student-initiated, and programme goals range from student development to community development.

Three of the four programmes (Ufundo, Shawco and Uskor) were initiated by students and in two cases (Shawco and Uskor) by medical students specifically. The Sasvo programme was initiated by staff at the Centre for Human Rights at the University of Pretoria. Although two of the programmes were started in the past four years (Sasvo in 1993 and Ufundo in 1995), two have been running between 33 and 54 years: Shawco has been running since 1943 while Uskor was launched in 1964.

The goals of the four programmes fall into two categories: student development and community development.

- Sasvo and Ufundo focus on student development as their main goal, while simultaneously seeking to inculcate a sense of community commitment in the participating students. However, the two organisations tackle this task quite differently: Sasvo provides opportunities for tertiary students at all universities, technikons and colleges to work as volunteers on projects during vacations. Ufundo's main goal is to support University of Cape Town students who require financial assistance through bursaries and loans which are given in exchange for their involvement in development projects.

- Shawco and Uskor aim primarily to address the development needs of communities through student involvement and provide a range of services and projects towards this aim: Shawco's goal is to achieve community development by providing `responsible, effective and integrated health, education and social services to marginalised and/or underserviced communities'. Programmes target women, youth and other sections of the community through service provision and skills development and they operate at eight different sites in the Cape Town area. Uskor deploys students and the knowledge and expertise of the university through six `service delivery and development' projects: health, entrepreneurship, job creation, youth development, adult basic education and training, and community resources development. It would seem that the Uskor programme is a smaller version of the Shawco operation.

Ufundo and Sasm focus on short-term projects, while the welfare organisations (Shawco and Uskor) adopt a more institutionalised approach to the delivery of services in the community.

Ufundo operates four projects - a computer literacy project affiliated to the university's computer science department and Anderson Consulting; a tutoring programme; an AIDS awareness project; and a project which focuses on nature awareness and environmental conservation.

Sasvo recruits participating students at tertiary education institutions countrywide. Sasvo's activities in mid-1997 engaged 300 higher education students in a major school renovation and human rights campaign in more than 50 Gauteng schools.

Shawco and Uskor offer services in similar fields, but operate in different ways and at different sites. Shawco offers health services through three mobile clinics, an HIV and AIDS resistance programme and a nutrition programme. The welfare services include social work counselling, job creation projects and the provision of meals to needy senior citizens. The education component of the organisation offers tutorial services and adult education programmes. Uskor offers entrepreneurial development and job creation projects, programmes that focus on primary health care, youth development and adult basic education and training, and a community resources programme.

Shawco functions on a larger scale than Uskor, but both have been operating for years. This gives their service delivery something of an institutional nature within the communities in which they operate. It would seem that the employment of permanent staff is an important factor in the long-term development of the two organisations' activities and in the meaningful involvement of the volunteers.

The organisations enjoy a loose relationship with the host institutions, but do not draw much institutional support of the land which is intrinsic to the higher education mission (eg, teaching and research).

Shawco and Uskor have a loose relationship with their host institutions, using the university's office space and financial, human resources and

other support systems, but functioning independently in other ways.

Ufundo runs four projects on campus and operates in partnership with various sections of the University of Cape Town administrative structure: the student affairs department, financial aid office and the office of the vice-chancellor. Sasvo projects are coordinated by staff at the Centre for Human Rights at the University of Pretoria, although they draw their student volunteers from higher education institutions around the country. At present none of the four organisations seems to attract a teaching or research interest on the part of the higher education institutions with which they are associated. In some cases university staff serve on decision-making structures of the organisations, but this seems to be a transient and fairly peripheral involvement. At least one organisation identified considerable potential for the host institution to support its transformation process through a closer and more hands-on association between its teaching and research activities, and through the on-the-ground activities of the student volunteers' organisation.

The present emphasis in the volunteer programmes thus seems to be on student involvement in general rather than the specialised involvement of student volunteers related to their field of study. The one exception is the deployment of medical students in Shawco and Uskor's health care programmes, but no academic credit is given for the practical experience gained by these student volunteers.

No information could be gained about the impact of the programmes in the communities with which they are involved. In the Ufundo and Sasvo programmes it seems that students are the primary beneficiaries of the programme-either through receiving financial aid or through the learning, work and development engagement they experience by virtue of their participation. This is consistent with the programme goals in each case. The benefits to the communities are still to be measured. If a closer and more engaged relationship were to evolve between the organisations and their host institutions, the research expertise of the institutions could assist the organisations in measuring their impact - both on the student volunteers involved and on the communities in which the projects are located.

The programmes tend to be small in scale.

The scale of student involvement in the four organisations surveyed ranges between 45 and 600 students: Ufundo involves 45 students; Uskor involves 250 students; Sasvo involved 300 students in its July 1997 projects; and Shawco involves 600 students.

Two of the organisations also employ full-time staff - Uskor has eight staff members while Shawco has 50 staff members, most of whom are hired from the local community. Shawco also draws on the services of one university lecturer (a social worker) on a part-time basis and one administration staff member seconded by the university on a full-time basis.

The research could not establish the extent of outreach of the programmes except in the case of Shawco. For example, the organisation operates at the following sites in the Western Cape: Elsies River, Heideveld, two sites in Khayalitsha, Kensington, Manenberg, Nyanga and Retreat. Some of the quantifiable deliverables include the following: three mobile clinics treat about 3 600 patients a year; the nutrition project feeds 8 000 preschool children and 30 000 primary school children daily; and the social work programme reaches close on 1 000 cases a year. In the course of this research, however, it was not possible to assess the impact of this work. While a 600-volunteer programme is substantial, it is nevertheless relatively small in comparison to, for example, the voluntary service for university students launched in Israel in 1972. In 1988 the Israeli programme involved 12 000 participants nationwide. One of the major reasons for the scale of this operation must be the fact that it was initiated and supported by government.

Furthermore, the scale of operations in the South African voluntary student organisations is undoubtedly affected by their insecure financial situation. The organsations are mostly dependent on annual fundraising efforts. Limited information on costs and financing strategies was obtained from three out of the four programmes, but these are global figures and should be closely analysed. The available information suggests that programme budgets are vastly different in scale, ranging from R240 000 a year in Ufundo's case (and R300 000 a project in the case of Sasvo) to

R3,9 million in the case of Shawco for 1997/98.

Funding strategies focus largely on donor partnerships and student fundraising efforts. Local funders (both corporate and nonprofit donors) provide the bulk of the funding for Ufundo and Sasvo while student fundraising efforts make up about 20% of Shawco's funds. This organisation also enjoys some support from an overseas donor. It would seem, however, that in some cases the programmes have been able to access government funds (for example, Shawco's nutrition programme and Sasvo's school building campaign accessed reconstruction and development programme funds).

2. WORKSTUDY PROGRAMMES

Overview of findings

Workstudy programmes on campus involve students in tasks and activities at different levels, each requiring greater expertise and experience (eg. as assistants in administrative, teaching, library, research, laboratory and technical activities as well as services to students on campus). There are certain categories of work (such as cleaning, technical maintenance, gardening and canteen duties) for which students are not employed. There are two main reasons for this: firstly to avoid displacing workers, and secondly in response to students' negative perceptions of menial work. While the main goal of the programmes is to provide financial assistance to needy students, two other goals have informed their design - student development and institutional capacity building, particularly in the case of historically disadvantaged institutions. These goals together with concerns about capacity to run off-campus projects, especially with large numbers of students, has determined the on-campus focus of these programmes.

Off-campus work study programmes take the form of off-campus placements, mainly in advice offices, research and nongovernmental organisations, and involve students and staff in activities and tasks related to research, administration, publicity work, teaching or tutoring and liaising with parliamentary portfolio committees. In one of the programmes

surveyed a contract is drawn up for each participant, specifying arrangements, responsibilities and obligations. Students work for 90 hours as academic interns or community interns and are given a living allowance as well as part payment on their student fee accounts, which are made only once the work required has been completed. The programme involves students of all races and has served as an eye-opener for many advantaged students who previously had no idea about conditions of life in disadvantaged communities.

Examples of the programmes surveyed

Workstudy programmes are well-developed at the University of Natal Pietermaritzburg and at five institutions in the Western Cape (the Peninsula Technikon, the University of the Western Cape, the University of Cape Town, the Cape Technikon and Stellenbosch University). The Western Cape initiatives are partly supported by the Desmond Tutu Educational Trust.

On-campus workstudy programmes

Most workstudy programmes in the Western Cape have focused on campus-based work. The types of work include the following major categories, almost all of which provide opportunities for work from basic to more advanced levels;

- Administrative assistants - the work ranges from mundane clerical tasks, such as photocopying, to highly responsible work involving the establishment and running of systems. For example, at the University of the Western Cape the workstudy office was at times run by student assistants, at least one of whom took up the position of workstudy coordinator on a full-time basis as a paid employee. This is a good example of how workstudy experience can prepare students for job opportunities;

- Teaching assistant - the range of work varies considerably from relatively junior assistants who work under close supervision to senior tutors who, in some instances, take on major teaching and marking responsibilities. Some teaching assistants are involved in specialised areas such as writing centres, in computer literacy training and various

types of mentorship. Concern has been expressed at some institutions that too much of the responsibility for teaching junior students has, in some instances, been left to teaching assistants, deployed through workstudy;

• Library assistants - the work varies from shelf-packing to more sophisticated duties. The University of the Western Cape book leasing scheme (attached to the library as an independent function) was at one point run by students' assistants. At the Peninsula Technikon the workstudy students have played a central role in library duties;

• Research assistants - this varies from simple exposure to the research environment to more extensive involvement (eg. Peninsula Technikon students have been involved in the development and maintenance of computer systems, etc);

• Laboratory/technical assistants - this includes laboratory teaching assistance (demonstrators), more specialised repair work on computers and the preparation and marking of practicals; and

• Students' service - this is a broad category involving students in a range of work benefiting the student community, for example, with campus police services, in the residences (reception, telephone duties etc.), with the student representatives' councils and student government (administrative duties, students' drivers etc.) Horticultural activities at Cape Technikon and dental community services at the University of the Western Cape also fall into this category.

These broad categories of workstudy show that students have not been employed on campus to do certain categories of work such as cleaning, technical maintenance, gardening, canteen duties, etc. The main reasons for this are to avoid displacing workers and in response to perceptions of students' attitudes towards certain types of work. In particular, black students (regardless of socioeconomic background) are perceived as being reluctant to do domestic work, as a reaction to racial and gender stereotyping. However, this area has never been properly studied and requires attention.

There are a number of reasons for the on-campus concentration of workstudy in the Western Cape. Firstly, there has been reluctance on the part of the Desmond Tutu Educational Trust to spread its increasingly limited resources in new directions. The retention of a focus on institutional capacity building (especially at the historically disadvantaged institutions, which receive the bulk of the trust's funding) has been an important factor in this respect. Secondly, there has been relatively little 'buy-in' from the tertiary institutions with concerns being raised about capacity (in the institutions, the Desmond Tutu Educational Trust and in the outside organisations) to run off-campus projects, especially with large numbers of students.

While the main goal of these programmes has been to provide financial assistance to needy students, two other goals have also informed their design: student development and institutional capacity building. In the case of historically disadvantaged institutions such as the University of the Western Cape and the Peninsula Technikon, workstudy has become an essential feature of the institutions which have come to rely on student work to carry out a range of essential services. For example, if workstudy students were not employed at Peninsula Technikons, the library would have to close at 8pm instead of 10pm. It is noteworthy that when workstudy funding from the Desmond Tutu Educational Trust was significantly reduced, both the University of the Western Cape and the Peninsula Technikon were obliged to draw on their own funds to sustain key areas of workstudy because students were undertaking core functions at the institution. Thus workstudy is used to address student financial aid, student development and institutional capacity building. In contrast, the workstudy focus at the University of Cape Town through the curriculum vitae-building programme has been primarily towards individual student development and financial aid. Although this programme was not able to function in the first semester of 1997 owing to the unavailability of Desmond Tutu Educational Trust funds, the university has since agreed to support the programme from its own funds.

The University of Natal Pietermaritzburg's Student Employment Project (Step) manages an extensive workstudy programme whereby students are able to serve as academic research interns in their fields of study. They work with a staff member or a student mentor working in a peer-tutoring programme under a staff supervisor. Students are offered

employment in the departments where they have been interns. Mentoring relationships help to identify potential in students that would otherwise have gone unnoticed, role models are provided for other students, career paths are identified and students are offered employment because of the specific experience gained in the internship programme. Academic research interns work under the same conditions as community interns participating in the Step project (see below).

Off-campus workstudy programmes

The University of Natal Pietermaritzburg's Step project launched its workstudy programme in 1991 with four aims in mind: To develop a mentoring relationship between academic staff members and students; to encourage students to do community work; to assist first-year students to overcome their learning difficulties; and to assist needy students in supplementing their fees and general income. The programme operates both on campus and off campus and students each work for 90 hours as academic interns or community interns. Students are given a `living allowance' and receive part payment on their student fee account. These payments are made biannually once the work required has been completed. Contracts are drawn up for each participant and each intern and their staff mentor attend a joint compulsory introductory workshop at the beginning of the year.

The programme has established close working relationships with 11 nongovernmental organisations through which off-campus placements are arranged. This facilitates the students' access to work such as research, administration, publicity work, tutoring disadvantaged students, following up with government institutions on behalf of elderly people, and working with portfolio committees dealing with land, conservation, housing, local government and a wealth of other sectors. Placement sites range from provincial and local government through advice offices to research organisations dealing with land issues and the results of political violence. In 1995 the initiative was taken to open the programme to all races. This in itself was an eye-opener because it highlighted areas where previously advantaged students were disadvantaged. Some students had never ventured into the townships and were horrified to find out about the

conditions in which old people had to collect their pensions; other students had been afraid to go into small business areas that were historically not white.

Step has identified a number of instances in which participating students changed their career paths as a result of their involvement in the programme, having had the opportunity to explore new work environments and to show what they were capable of doing.

3. COMMUNITY OUTREACH PROGRAMMES AND EXTENSION SERVICES

Overview of findings

These programmes have been initiated within higher education institutions, either as department/faculty initiatives or as institution-wide initiatives. Participants include students and staff who are involved in tasks that require the specialised knowledge and skills of their academic disciplines and sometimes involve interdisciplinary or multidisciplinary activities. In most cases recognition is given, either in the form of academic credit or in the form of research publications. In some cases practical support and services for local communities flow out of the teaching and research activities.

These programmes draw their financial support from a number of sources, including contributions by the institution, support from parastatal institutions, private sector grants or foreign donor support. These activities are seen as directly related to the mission of higher education in terms of a commitment to quality teaching, scholarship and research which is responsive to the developmental needs of society. In this approach, responsiveness to societal needs is integrated into the institution's mainstream activities or is expressed through the main functions of higher education (teaching, scholarship and research).

This contrasts sharply with the approach that sees `community service' as a distinctive, third leg of higher education's mission (along with teaching and research). In this alternative approach, responsiveness to societal needs can become an add-on activity, peripheral to the main functions of

teaching and research. However, in neither of the two approaches is service delivery seen as a distinctive function of higher education.

The link between these programmes and the mainstream activities of the higher education institutions has the potential to transform relationships between society and higher education. Although the community outreach and extension services are distinct programmes, they involve the higher education institution in a longer-term relationship with specific communities.

Examples of community outreach programmes

This is a category of programmes which seeks to make the mainstream activities of institutions more relevant and responsive to community need. The form this takes is community outreach through which the special expertise of higher education is applied to community issues. However, it does not necessarily involve service provision. This approach has been adopted by the University of the North West and the Technikon Northern Transvaal.

The University of the North West aims to involve all its faculties in the development of the university's surrounding community. The purpose of involving students is to give them practical work experience and to expose them to community issues. Community service is compulsory for all students and is completed in different ways. For example, one of the department of chemistry's projects involves 25 students in three related activities: performing a chemical and biological analysis of rural water supplies in the Molopo region of North West province; correlating the analysis results to the health of community members and disease profiles; and running intervention and education programmes for the 12 villages in the region. The project is a partnership between the University of the North West and the Water Research Commission. The water commission operates in the province and aims to create the links between research, teaching and community service that enable the university to be responsive to the broader community's needs.

The department of mechanical engineering at the Technikon Northern Transvaal has been approached by the Medunsa Organisation

for Disabled Entrepreneurs to form a joint venture for the development of a mobile spaza. Under this programme senior mechanical engineering students, under the guidance of their lecturer, will design the mobile spaza and supervise and control the building of a proto-type model. The students on the project will be divided into four teams - suspension and steering, platform and superstructure, engine and power-pack, and control and electricity. In this service-learning project, students will be challenged to take what they have learnt in the classroom and to apply it by helping other people.

Examples of extension service programmes

A number of the programmes surveyed were primarily established to set up a different site for research and learning. They express the mission of the institutions in different contexts and often generate services to which the community concerned has access. The following programmes are briefly described: the University of the Western Cape's pharmacy and dentistry programmes, the Technikon Witwatersrand's community projects, the University of the Witwatersrand's Rural Facility, and the University of Venda's Legal Aid Clinic.

The University of the Western Cape's department of community dentistry runs two projects which involve student assistants:

• The Eros project is focused on preventive health and aims to improve the oral hygiene of scholars at the Eros School for Cerebral Palsied Children; and

• The denture project is based at a clinic in Guguletu and was established to provide a free denture service to the elderly in Guguletu, Langa, Nyanga and Khayelitsha. Historically dental services were not extended to this community and the demand for dentures has been phenomenal. While the conditions in which students provide the service are less than ideal, the opportunity offered to students to provide the service has resulted in the rapid development of skills in the field of prosthetic dentistry. The project has also highlighted the conditions of pensioners in disadvantaged communities.

The University of the Western Cape's School of Pharmacy introduced a community pharmacy asthma project to investigate the potential for using pharmacists and community pharmacists to improve the identification and management of asthmatic patients who visit pharmacies for medication. The project evolved in response to a need expressed by community pharmacists, and proved valuable in exposing undergraduate students to aspects of pharmacy practice.

The Technikon Witwatersrand's community projects division aims to support one aspect of the institution's mission which is to `structure its activities to promote the community's quality of life[4] through projects launched in disadvantaged communities. Through a community projects officer, different departments engage in community outreach programmes. About 120 students have been involved. Some spend an average of one day a week doing community service while others participate during technikon holidays. Examples of the projects include a water purification project in Pilanesberg; a health clinic in Alexandra used by taxi drivers and commuters; fine art education in disadvantaged communities; computer literacy programmes for teachers; peer tutoring programmes for matric students; and bridging programmes for post-matric students. Depending on the particular project, the students involved in the different projects may receive bursaries or academic credits, and in some cases are paid for their participation.

The mission of the University of the Witwatersrand's Rural Facility sums up the purpose of its work as follows: `The University of the Witwatersrand should through a permanent presence in a typical rural area create a multidisciplinary and interdisciplinary endeavour which will contribute to the development of such areas, which will inform society of rural needs, which will provide a venue for experiential community-based learning for postgraduate and undergraduate students from a spectrum of facilities, which will alert Wits graduates to the challenges and rewards of working in such a rural area and which will ultimately benefit not only the immediate communities but South African society as a whole on an ongoing basis, through the service, research, advocacy and policy making of the students and staff who are participants in and products of the WRF endeavour.'

---

[4]Technikon Witwatersrand mission statement, 1997.

The rural facility is involved in numerous projects which employ about 40 full-time staff and involve many different Wits departments. For example, the department of occupational therapy in Johannesburg runs a training course for community-based rehabilitation workers in conjunction with the Tintswalo Hospital rehabilitation unit. The rural facility provides accommodation for students and trainers, runs some of the training sessions on community development topics, and has helped evaluate the programme. Mechanical engineering students have contributed to this project by designing and building low-cost walkers for local disabled people.

The work of the rural facility is closely tied with the curriculum as students and faculty staff use the facility to take their academic work (research, scholarship and teaching) to new levels.

The University of Venda's Legal Aid Clinic is one of about 18 legal aid clinics attached to universities around the country. It seeks to give form to that aspect of the mission of the University of Venda which commits it to serve the community alongside its teaching and research priorities. The goals of the clinic are to provide practical experience for senior law students, to train attorneys and to serve the community by making legal aid available to indigent people. The clinic is run by the law department which provides specialised staff input. Final-year students receive academic credit for the 32 hours of practical work each does in the clinic and there are 63 students involved in the programme this year. The candidate attorneys (11 in 1997) also receive accreditation for the training they receive in the clinic. The clinic ensures that it reaches unemployed or low-income members of the local community by applying a means test, and this year and in the period July 1996 to June 1997 it processed an average of 270 cases a month (the total for the year was 3 234). Funding is obtained from the university, the Attorney's Fidelity Fund and the Legal Aid Board, but funding is one of the areas in which the programme is most vulnerable.

4. CURRICULUM-RELATED PROGRAMMES

Overview of findings

Curriculum-related programmes refer to credit-bearing internships integrated into the curriculum which have been a feature of mainstream professional education for many years. The primary purpose is related to learning and skills development (to supplement academic learning with some form of experiential learning) rather than financial assistance or provision of services to the community. These programmes take the form of community service in government or in nongovernmental and community-based organisations, or may take the form of placements in particular workplaces or organisations as a requirement of the course.

Examples of curriculum-related programmes

A number of the programmes surveyed provide opportunities for the institutions to restructure their curriculum design in relation to community need. Programmes in this category include those launched by the University of Natal Pietermaritzburg, the Johannesburg College of Education, Leaf College and the University of the North.

In 1992, the University of Natal Pietermaritzburg's theology department piloted the integration of internships as a credit-bearing course. Curriculum change was brought about through knowledge gained from research in townships and squatter camps. The information obtained has been used to improve the training of priests who go back into these communities. This is a growing project in the theology department.

In 1996 the university set up a pilot study in the political studies department where students were required to put in 40 hours community work as part of their course work for a citizenship and community-service programme. The class was created to `encourage students to think about and encounter issues pertaining to citizenship by a combination of course work and an internship with an approved community partner'. The internship was spread over a semester and required a minimum of 40 hours of voluntary community service in either governmental (provincial

or local) or nongovernmental work. The curriculum for the class focused on researching and understanding the role of citizenship in a democratic society, working in the internship, and reflecting on those experiences through a journal and in class discussion. Students in the class were also required to complete a final report and presentation to link the major themes from the classroom to the experience they gained in the field.

Leaf College is a post-matric residential college which aims to address the needs of students who have particular abilities in commerce and engineering, but who are educationally underprepared through inadequate access to educational resources. One way in which the college incorporates community service into its curriculum is through its engineering course. Students, working in groups, identify a technology-related problem in their community and design a product to solve the problem. The groups make a model and a technical drawing of the product, write a report, and give an oral presentation on the product. The design project gives students an opportunity to apply what they are learning in the classroom to the real world in the context of helping other people. The project also helps students to develop skills in thinking, organising, communicating and working in a team.

The University of the North's National Community Water and Sanitation Training Institute was established with the primary aim of influencing higher education to engage more students in programmes which will contribute to the development of the human resources needed in the community water and sanitation sector. The institute is negotiating with the university to establish an agriculturalist generalist programme which would focus on engineering and rural development. It is anticipated that the institute would play a significant role in developing the curriculum for the programme, teach several courses on environmental science, and facilitate the placement of students in community-based work in the water and sanitation sector.

5. PLACEMENTS

Overview of findings

Internship has for many years been a feature of mainstream teaching in higher education institutions. It integrates practical or experiential learning into the curriculum, but traditionally does not aim to provide service to a community or to the organisation in which the student is placed as a primary or secondary goal. Placements are a requirement of the course and their primary purpose is skills development for individual students. These programmes provide a mixture of academic and experiential learning and help to improve the work preparedness of graduates. However, in the face of financial difficulties faced by higher education institutions and rationalisation measures introduced by employers, placements and internships have become increasingly difficult to organise on a large scale. The number of students who can be admitted to these courses is limited in some cases by the number of internship positions available.

Supervision, monitoring and assessment of interns adds considerably to the workload of staff, both in higher education institutions and in the company or organisation in which interns have been placed. The exercise is seen as costly because students have to be paid, but their contribution to improved productivity or services is small. In spite of these problems, the internships are regarded as important opportunities for generating more relevant learning and improving the employment opportunities of graduates.

Placements of interns in this category are thus not regarded as a form of community service in this study.

Features of these programmes

Higher education institutions are all trying to become responsive to the demands of the world of work. Internship has for many years been one of the ways in which institutions have tried to integrate practical or experiential learning into the curriculum. Placements are a course

requirement and their primary purpose is skills development for individual students. Students also benefit from the secondary spin-offs of placements by gaining exposure to the work culture, developing increased confidence, etc. These placements do not traditionally aim to provide service to a community or to the organisation in which the student is placed, either as a primary or a secondary goal.

The case studies below show that in a number of fields the traditional forms of internship are becoming increasingly difficult to organise in the face of cost-cutting in institutions and in the workplace.

The ML Sultan Technikon in Durban is the only technikon in South Africa that offers diplomas in medical technology and clinical technology. The medical technology diploma has a six-month compulsory internship at the end of the three years of study and the clinical technology diploma has a full-year internship in the third year of the diploma. This year is a mixture of academic and experiential learning as students are assessed at the hospital where they work and write a formal academic exam. In both cases students must complete their internship to obtain their diplomas.

The number of students that can be accepted by the technikons for the above diplomas is limited by the number of placement positions in teaching hospitals. M L Sultan has problems placing students in Durban as there is only one hospital. This means students have to go to hospitals in Cape Town, Johannesburg and Pretoria for their internships. The South African Medical Council has asked other technikons not to offer medical technology diplomas because of the shortage of places in hospitals for training. Even so, M L Sultan is starting to face problems with placements because of rationalisation and cutbacks at hospitals. It is also not possible to expand placements to clinics as students have to have access to specific equipment and procedures to complete their training.

All students are monitored by technikon staff and are supervised by senior medical staff at hospitals. The monitoring by the technikon staff of students in Cape Town, Johannesburg and Pretoria has added considerably to the staff workload. Because staff have full teaching loads the monitoring has to occur during exam time at the technikon. The monitoring of internship also adds to the cost of the course and both courses consistently run at a loss.

The national engineering diploma consists of four semesters of study at the technikon and one year's internship. The internship can be split into two sessions. The individual institution monitors the students but the day-to-day supervision is undertaken by the employer. Quality control is maintained by the Engineering Council which accredits each institution. As part of the accreditation process the council assesses the monitoring of experiential learning and assesses a sample of students.

The placement of engineering technikon students has become problematic. Previously there were tax incentives for companies to undertake training but now there are no incentives and companies are not keen to take on student interns because they are attempting to rationalise their workforces. The exercise is seen as costly because the students have to be paid but there is no impact on productivity or the `bottom line'. Schemes to overcome these problems, for example by not paying students, have not worked and companies will not consider laying off workers in order to use students.

University engineering students are expected to undertake some sort of experiential learning during their degree course. However, the length and nature of this aspect of the course is left up to individual institutions. Generally, the length of experiential learning is 12-16 weeks. In some universities the requirement is two periods of six weeks. The only opportunity to undergo this is in the December holidays but this is difficult because industry winds down. Industry is even more resistant to taking on university students than technikon students because they have no practical training and are therefore more of a burden.

For some students their placements in industry have been positive experiences, but for many the lack of supervision means that the internship is wasted. This is an important factor if there is any consideration of addressing labour market shortages or social needs through national service for graduate engineers because new graduates need careful direction.

6. OBSERVATIONS

The programmes are mostly initiated within individual institutions. Virtually all the case studies examined are institution-based and were initiated by one or more of the higher education stakeholders (the institution as a whole, or a group of students, or a specific department or faculty). In contrast with some of the examples from other countries, none of these programmes were government-initiated, nor did they receive government support. Furthermore, none of the programmes were community-driven.

About two thirds of the programmes surveyed are closely related to the mission of the higher education institutions and use the skills and expertise located within these institutions. These programmes are intended to extend the institution's knowledge base through its engagement with new, underdeveloped sites, and in a number of cases practical support and services for local communities are flowing out of the teaching and research activities being undertaken by the programme.

The programmes are locally organised.

All the programmes examined in this study are locally organised, operating from the institutional base within which they were created. Except for Sasvo, they all draw their students and staff from the particular institution in which they were initiated. Sasvo involves students from higher education institutions across the country in its projects.

The student volunteer organisations enjoy a loose relationship with the host institutions, often using the institutional facilities to run their programmes, but they are not able to draw much on the unique skills and expertise that the institutions have to offer.

In a number of cases faculties or departments take direct responsibility for running the extension services or community outreach programmes. This tends to happen in those cases where the programmes are closely related to the teaching and research mission of the higher education institution.

External funding is an essential support in all the programmes surveyed.

The research found that in virtually all cases, external funding was essential in getting the programmes launched and in sustaining them. Funds are provided by a wide range of sources: South African companies, South African foundations, in some cases parastatal organisations such as the South African Atomic Energy- Board, and foreign donors.

In a number of cases the institutions contribute to the funding base of the programmes, particularly where they perceive the programme to be in their interests. It would seem that these commitments then enable the institutions to leverage additional funds from the other sources such as private sector and donor organisations. Very few programmes are able to rely entirely on financial support from the institution that launched them. At the same time, when grant funding was reduced (as was the case with some of the Western Cape and University of Natal workstudy programmes) the institutions found the funds from their own budgets to sustain the programmes. These financial commitments provide strong indications that the programmes are regarded as adding value to the institutions concerned - either to achieving their mission or to developing institutional capacity. The programmes often have multiple goals.

The research showed found that the programmes often have more than one goal. To determine who benefited most directly from each programme, it was necessary to try and identify the primary goal in each case. This helped to establish whether there were any secondary beneficiaries and/ or byproducts in each programme. It also helped to determine how the programme activities relate to the mission of higher education and the extent to which the activities require the special expertise of higher education.

Irrespective of who initiates the programme, the major benefit is derived by the programme participants.

The analysis suggests that irrespective of which higher education stakeholders initiate the programmes, the major beneficiaries in each case

are the active participants in the programme - the students and staff of the higher education institution involved. In some cases the institution also derives direct benefit from the programme.

For each of the stakeholders, the benefit takes different forms. For example, students may benefit from the financial aid they receive in exchange for their participation in the programme; they also gain work experience, grow in confidence, and develop specific and transferable skills. Many of the programmes enable students to learn how to work independently as well as with other people, and help them acquire life skills such as improved communication, punctuality and an ability to keep appointments.

Participation in the service programmes provides staff with opportunities to make their work more relevant to a transforming curriculum and assists them in generating new knowledge. Some programmes offer new opportunities for research and consultancy; both of which may attract private funds from new sources, and this ultimately benefits institutions which are facing a financial squeeze.

In the case of the institutions, some programmes contribute to developing institutional capacity (especially in the case of the Western Cape on-campus workstudy programmes which deploy students to do core work in the institution at cheap rates). The programmes also have an impact on the curriculum, they sensitise academics to the need for skills development and the need to bridge gaps between institutions and community activities, and they support affirmative action efforts by helping the institutions groom their own academics. The programmes facilitate systemic institutional change through the development of partnerships internally and externally.

In examining the benefit of the programmes to the communities they are intended to serve, the research found that the definition of the community shifts from one programme to another. In some cases the term `community' refers to the campus community while in other cases it refers to poor or disadvantaged communities in a particular local area. From the available information it would seem that the programmes are in a position to add value to the communities (as defined in each case), but in the absence of evaluations, impact assessments and the views of the communities themselves, it was not possible to estimate what impact

these services were having on the scale of need. The impression given by the available information is that the impact is small in comparison to the enormous need in most South African communities. For example, the survey of legal aid clinics conducted during this research found that 18 clinics countrywide address less than 1% of the estimated need for legal aid. In the case of the workstudy programmes, however, the value of services rendered to the institutions (which in themselves constitute the community for the programmes) could be deduced from the fact that when external funding was reduced, the institutions found funds from their own budgets to continue the programmes.

The traditional internships that place students in the workplace do not refer to the notion of community and our conclusion is that these should not be regarded as forms of community service. These placements do not provide services to the disadvantaged, nor do they respond to community need; they are placements whose primary purpose is to enable the students to gain practical experience.

The programmes tend to be small in scale and may not be easily expanded or replicated.

The student volunteer service programmes are relatively small in scale. The factors influencing this situation include their insecure financial position and the low level of institutional involvement. Furthermore, volunteer programmes typically appeal to youthful idealism and professional altruism and depend for their success on a `culture of voluntarism'. Critics argue that South Africa has a weak culture of voluntarism mainly because of widespread poverty and social inequality and because volunteer programmes are unlikely to develop on a large scale unless they are closely linked with direct benefits for participants.

A further criticism is that the small-scale nature of volunteer programmes limits them to a marginal role in a context where the scale of need is large, both in terms of services and human resource development. While the volunteer programmes could be strengthened and expanded (for example, through academic credit for participation), the organisations are hesitant about this issue. Financial constraints, as well as the careful consideration of organisational, administrative and human resource

capacity and sustainability issues have resulted in a cautious attitude towards expansion. Furthermore, they argue that their current strengths (flexibility, local responsiveness and possibilities for building local partnerships) may be lost in expansion.

In the case of the service-related activities that are closely related with the higher education missions (eg. extension services, community outreach programmes and community internship programmes) it was found that an assessment of the scale of these operations depends on the nature of the activity. In some cases, such as extension services, the outreach may be quite substantial. For example, the survey has found that the medical, social work or tutoring programmes can handle thousands of cases a year and can be replicated more extensively if funding and other support mechanisms are in place. However, in cases where high levels of skill and specialised facilities are required (such as the University of the Witwatersrand Rural Facility or the University of the Western Cape's dental faculty programmes), the outreach is of necessity more limited and may not be easily expanded or replicated.

At present most of the programmes tend to encompass short projects which link with the curriculum and do not interfere with existing jobs. Nevertheless the idea proposed by some organisations of significantly expanding this type of community service would have to be examined closely, as expansion could have implications for labour displacement.

SECTION 3

A SURVEY OF SERVICE PROGRAMMES IN NINE COUNTRIES

A number of developing countries have introduced compulsory national service programmes for higher education students to address manpower shortages and national development needs. Seven of these programmes as well as two voluntary programmes - one in Israel and one in the USA - were studied for this paper.

The main sources of data were Eberly and Sherraden's (1990) survey of nine national service programmes[5] and Albrecht and Ziderman's (1992) work on financing universities in developing countries. Eberly and Sherraden selected countries that `have substantial or noteworthy experience with national service and that offer informative contrasts in programme design as well as variation in geographic, political and economic contrasts'. Five of these programmes - those in Costa Rica, Nigeria, Indonesia, Israel and Mexico are aimed at higher education students and were therefore included in this study. In addition, service programmes for higher education students in Ghana, Botswana and Nepal were examined. Finally, the study considered a variety of service programmes for higher education students in the USA -AmeriCorps, the Cornell Tradition, the Bonner Scholars' Programme, the National Teacher Corps and the National Health Service Corps.

The following analysis is based on the information at the disposal of the research team during July and August 1997. The programmes surveyed may well have changed in the past five years, and details of the analysis may therefore not be current. Nevertheless, the international experience provides useful lessons for South Africa and forms a basis for the comparisons made in section 4.

---

[5]The programmes surveyed were based in China, Costa Rica, Nigeria, Indonesia, Israel, Mexico, the USA, Canada and West Germany.

Goals

An analysis of the stated goals of the programmes shows that they address, or seek to address, a number of complex, interrelated goals:

- Bringing a university closer to the community/nation (Mexico and Costa Rica);

- National development (Mexico, Nigeria, Botswana, Costa Rica, Indonesia, Nepal and Ghana);

- Repaying the nation for free education (Mexico and Costa Rica);

- Providing practical experience for university students (Mexico, Indonesia, Nepal and USA);

- Providing career training (Mexico and USA);

- Personal growth (Botswana);

- National unity and integration (Botswana, Nigeria and Indonesia);

- Civic duty and commitment (Nigeria, Costa Rica, Ghana and USA);

- Assisting disadvantaged individuals and communities (Indonesia, Israel and USA); and

- Improving the higher education curriculum (Nepal and USA).

Although the purpose, effects and design of these programmes are varied, all attempt to address socioeconomic need through the deployment of educated manpower in the form of higher education students. Organisation

In seven of the nine countries surveyed service was, or is, compulsory and the service period ranges from 150 hours to two years. In Nigeria and Ghana national service is compulsory after graduation. Nigerians who graduate from any university inside or outside Nigeria are liable for one year's service and employers are prohibited from hiring graduates who do not possess the certificate of national service. In Ghana the period of

compulsory service was one year when the programme began in the 1970s but was increased to two years to increase the supply of students. In Costa Rica, Mexico, Nepal and Indonesia a minimum period of service is undertaken during the students' studies and is a requirement for graduation. In Botswana the service programme is a requirement for government sponsorship of post-secondary education and occurs before students begin their studies. The voluntary programme in Israel, Perach, is undertaken by students during their studies while in the USA some programmes are aimed at potential higher education students, others at students in institutions and others again at graduates. Participants in the AmeriCorps programme, which provides education awards in exchange for community service, can undertake community service at any time in their student careers and the awards can be used to pay off student loans or to finance tertiary education.

Eberly and Sherraden indicate that `the reality of mandatory service is often more complex than official requirements indicate'. They claim that programmes such as those in Indonesia, Mexico and Nigeria may not in practice include every student because of lack of financial resources to operate the programmes and/or corruption or cheating in programme requirements. In Botswana rapid growth in secondary enrolment and budgetary constraints means that not all school leavers can be accommodated. In 1991, 75% of the more than 6 000 school leavers participated. Those not able to be accommodated (usually those with the lowest pass marks) have to obtain an exemption certificate.

Deployment

Participants in the service programmes studied generally do not have any choice as to where they are sent or in which projects they participate. In Costa Rica students have no control over where they are sent, although some attention is paid to fields of study in deciding assignments. In Nigeria graduates have no choice in selecting their assignment or the location of the assignment. Assignments are located as far as possible from the home of the participant but are, wherever possible, relevant to students' professional skills and/or national need. In Botswana participants are allocated to districts according to requests received from district representatives. They then attend a one-week orientation course at which

they indicate their career preferences. However, career preferences are often not available in remote and rural areas. In Nepal where the government implemented required rural service for all higher degree university students, priority was given to the most remote and least developed areas of the country and students were allocated to villages by random ballot. In Mexico many government agencies have small stipends to offer and they try to recruit the best students. The system therefore functions largely as an economic market with the best students receiving the best positions and highest stipends.

The programmes studied do not allow students to choose their assignments, and a continuing issue has been students attempting to influence decisions on their deployment. A study of the Nigerian National Youth Service Corps shows that in 1982-84, when staff were not protected from pressure by students and family members, 17% of corps members were assigned to their home states. However, in 1985-86 when they were protected from such pressures only 1% were assigned to home states.

Management and coordination

The service programmes in the nine countries have been initiated, managed, coordinated, administered and supervised in a wide variety of ways. In Nigeria, Israel, Botswana and Ghana, where service takes place before or after higher education, government has been instrumental in initiating, organising and supervising service programmes. This has in some cases necessitated setting up extensive bureaucracies. In Nigeria the National Youth Service Corps is governed and managed by the Federal Ministry of Social Development Youth and Culture. The National Youth Service Corps directorate includes representatives of the academic community, employers, the armed forces and other government ministries. The directorate headquarters in Lagos is responsible for policy making, finances and the general administration of the scheme. Directorate headquarters also controls the mobilisation of students and their deployment to the 21 different states in Nigeria. Each state also has a National Youth Service Corps secretariat which is responsible for matching the qualifications of participants with the needs of employers in the state. State officials control the day-to-day administration of the scheme within their states. They keep in contact with employers and participants to

monitor performance, pay out the monthly allowance and deal with recurring problems.

In contrast to this the Israeli government-funded voluntary service programme, which uses higher education students as tutors of disadvantaged children, maintains a small bureaucracy. The Ministry of Education selects the children who can benefit from a paraprofessional relationship but tutors are monitored and supervised by past participants in Perach who are in turn supervised by an education professional.

In Botswana the Tirelo Setshaba programme has a small secretariat which is responsible for allocating participants to projects and for orientation. However, service is overseen by government departments, as well as by parastatal or nongovernmental organisations.

In the four countries where service takes place during higher education there is varied government involvement in the service programmes. Costa Rica is the only programme studied where there appears to be no government involvement. The Trabajo Comunal Universitario programme was initiated by the university, and the vice-rectory for social action was created as the organisational structure through which to implement the Trabajo Comunal Universitario programme. The projects are initiated from inside the university and the directors of projects are professors identified with the type of work to be undertaken. Professors are given a workload credit for directing these projects and officially devote a minimum of one-fourth of their time to projects. Supervision is the university's work but according to Eberly and Sherraden `a great deal depends on the commitment and skill of the community project coordinator'.

In Indonesia, Mexico and Nepal government has made a period of service compulsory for higher education students but the programmes are largely administered and supervised by university faculty members. Kulaih Kerja Nyata in Indonesia operates on a set of guidelines issued by the Directorate of Higher Education but each university has an institute of community service that operates the programme. Faculty members have to help students to overcome problems encountered while doing projects in the villages and to do related research. In Nepal national development service was initiated by government and rural service was legislated for all higher

degree university students between 1974 and 1980. The programme was financed by government through the university budget, supplemented by the United Nations International Culture and Education Fund (Unice fl. However, the university administered the programme and students worked under university and local community supervision, partly as teachers in rural secondary schools and partly as general community development workers.

The Servicio Social of Mexico was made mandatory for higher education students by federal law in 1947. The programme remained undeveloped until 1978, when a national coordinating commission for social service for students in higher education was established by government. The commission is organisationally part of the Secretariat of Programme and Budget and it and other governmental agencies, such as the Secretary of Health and of Education, share in financial support of students. The commission has also formed a system of state committees to coordinate Servicio Social but control is limited to advice, service and so forth. It attempts to create some unity by holding meetings, collecting statistics and organising some placements. The office coordinates only 8 000 out of about 43 000 placements a year, while 25 000 placements are controlled by professors at the university. Each institution organises and manages Servicio Social as it thinks best. Outside of medicine, the programme is highly decentralised. This situation, as in the other three university-administered service programmes, has resulted in a lack of coordination and a wide range in quality. Taking the most extreme example, there are 23 sets of regulations for Servicio Social at the National University in Mexico City, and no one accurately documents how many students participate. It may be argued that Servicio Social is decentralised to the level of individual professors, who often use Servicio Social participants for academic research.

In America some of the programmes are government-driven and managed while others are initiated and coordinated by individual higher education institutions. The National Health Corps is based within the bureau of primary health care in the Public Health Service, while the Cornell Tradition is organised and managed by the university. The AmeriCorps programme is an example of a programme which is nationally coordinated but locally implemented. The National and Community Service Trust Act of 1993 established the Corporation for National Service to `expand

opportunities for Americans to serve our country, rebuild their communities, and help pay for their education in return'. The corporation operates under the control of a bipartisan board of directors and has a management and administrative team. The corporation has three main programmes: Learn and Serve America, AmeriCorps and the National Senior Service Corps. These programmes consist of hundreds of different programmes. The Corporation for National Service selects the programmes though a rigorous process and provides resources, oversight and evaluation to ensure that the programmes meet their goals. The programmes are locally managed and implemented and consist of public-private partnerships with governors, national and community-based organisations, corporations and foundations, colleges and universities, and branches of local, state and federal government. State commissions on national and community service or similar entities appointed by the governor of each state have also been established and ensure that the most important local priorities are met and that service activities are coordinated though each state.

Nature of programmes

In the majority of programmes surveyed, governments initiated the programmes to address general or particular development needs. The programmes surveyed can be divided into two groups:

- Those in which students are deployed to alleviate skills shortages in areas of need; and

- Those in which students undertake a wide variety of projects aimed at providing some form of social service.

Deploying students to alleviate skills shortages

In the programmes in which students are deployed to alleviate skills shortages in areas of need, students are generally engaged in full-time work assignments for a minimum of nine months. In Ghana, Nigeria, Nepal and Israel most students spend their national service teaching or lecturing at education institutions. In Ghana and Nepal the service programmes were largely directed at responding to labour market shortages for university graduates in rural secondary schools while in Israel 90% of participating students tutor children from disadvantaged backgrounds. In

Nigeria two-thirds of the total corps spend their national service teaching or lecturing at educational institutions. The other third are involved in health, agricultural programmes or working for the private sector such as oil companies. [6] National Teacher Corps in the USA was designed to ameliorate the deteriorating education systems in low-income and rural areas by recruiting tertiary education students and experienced teachers for two-year internships there. The National Health Service Corps recruits health care professionals for placement in rural and inner city communities with professional shortages.

Deploying students in projects to provide a social service

In Nepal students are responsible for mobilising local resources and manpower for community projects, including health and nutritional education, reforestation campaigns, adult literacy teaching, improved sanitation, water supplies, agricultural and horticultural demonstrations, and family planning promotion. In Indonesia students receive some training and then go out in interdisciplinary teams of seven to villages for general community development projects. In Mexico 67% of placements are within the university and the remainder mostly within Mexico City in projects concerned with urban automobile transportation, fishing, public education, family services and telecommunications. In 1986/87, according to official estimates, about 50% of participants worked within the university, about 30% in government agencies and about 20% in the private sector. About 80% were in urban placements and 20% in rural placements (mostly in health care). In Costa Rica students participate in projects located in and around the capital city of San Jose. At the beginning of 1985 there were 74 projects: 35% were in social sciences, 23% in engineering and agriculture, 20% in health, 12% in basic sciences, 7% in arts and letters, and 3% in research. Projects at this time included conducting research on food protection; grading exams on philosophy and literature; translating English into Spanish; conducting research and teaching environmental education in the national park system, developing software for science instruction; evaluating the impact of municipal investments; starting

---

[6]In Nigeria all corps members are also expected to initiate part-time community development activities such as public health education, literacy classes or modern farming methods. In Nepal students also play a dual role. They work under university and local supervision, partly as a teacher in a rural secondary school and partly as a general community development worker.

school and home vegetable gardens; teaching adult literacy; and providing occupational therapy to the aged. A large number, as can be seen from this short list, are research-oriented projects. In America the programmes have a wide range of activities and goals. In the AmeriCorps programme, participants assist needy communities or individuals and may be involved in such diverse programmes as tutoring children, assisting crime victims, helping homebound citizens or people with disabilities, restoring national parks and coastlines, immunising children against preventable diseases, etc.

Relationship with curriculum

Although most of the service programmes studied are more oriented towards service than learning, some emphasis on learning is apparent in the programmes of Mexico, Nepal, Costa Rica and Indonesia. All involve students in service projects before graduation and arrange in limited ways for students to reflect on what is being learnt from the service experience. In some cases Servicio Social in Mexico is oriented towards career training. This is most true in medicine, education and social work. In medicine Servicio Social is viewed as an internship; in education it is defined as practical training; and in social work it is viewed as additional career training.

In Costa Rica the service programmes were initiated by the university. At first service was seen as paying society for higher education but now it is seen as applied education. Despite this no curriculum credit is given for the service work undertaken, the programme does not substitute for practicals and often the work in the Trabajo Comunal Universitario programme does not relate to the students' studies. Because the Trabajo programme is not included in the plan of study there is a lack of motivation on the part of students and many students see it as a requirement which means only extra work. The programme is also for this reason regarded as falling short of applying professional skills. Supervision is carried out using group techniques. Final reports are required of participating students before graduation.

In Nepal the length of service is one year and it is carried out before the last three semesters of academic study. Students spend two months in

orientation and training and receive limited field support. They are evaluated and earn credit towards their degree. They work under university and local supervision.

Indonesian students participate in the service programme in their fourth year, following completion of course work and before writing baccalaureate dissertations. Any student absent from the villages for two weeks or longer automatically fails the Kulaih Kerja Nyata programme and cannot receive a degree until this has been satisfactorily completed. Although the service work is evaluated and earns students credit towards their degrees the relationship between the Kulaih Kerja Nyata experience and the university curricula seems to be limited. Some attention is paid to fields of study in making assignments: for example, a project involving land surveys would include a civil engineering student. Students receive three hours of credit and are graded in connection with their Kulaih Kerja Nyata experience. Fifty percent of the grade is given for field activities and is determined by the student's supervisor, the subdistrict head and the village head. The balance of the grade comes from training, the work plan, the approach to the community, work standards and attitude, methods and results of village observation, and student reports.

Scale of project

Eight of the nine programmes surveyed were compulsory. However, as Eberly and Sherraden point out, `the reality of mandatory service is often more complex than official requirements indicate'. They claim that programmes such as those in Indonesia, Mexico and Nigeria may not in practice include every student because of a tack of financial resources to operate the programmes and/or corruption or cheating in programme requirements. In Botswana rapid growth in secondary enrolment and budgetary constraints mean that not all school leavers can be accommodated. The estimated number of students participating in these programmes is given below.

Nigeria: In 1974 the number of members of the Nigeria Youth Service Corps was 2 400 and by 1984 it had increased to 34 000 and to 42 000 in 1991.

Costa Rica: At first projects were voluntary and experimental. In 1977 there were 13 projects and 334 participating students. By 1984, 1 436 students served a total of 423 000 hours in about 80 projects, most in public institutions. By 1987 there were 36 000 students enrolled at the University of Costa Rica and all were expected to undertake 150 to 300 hours of community service. The number of students per project depends on the scope of the project and the number of students available for service at a given time. Some projects have less than 10 students while others have 40 to 50. The average is 10 to 15.

Indonesia: In 1973, Kulaih Kerja Nyata was established in 13 universities and the study-service concept was incorporated into Indonesia's second five-year development plan (1974-79). The Kulaih programme was offered at all government universities by 1985 and at several private universities. In 1978, it was in place in 40 of the 44 government universities, and the number of students in the programme had grown from 400 in 1973 to 6 000 in 1978. By 1985, it was mandatory at 37 out of the 44 government universities and offered at all of them, as well as at several private universities. (Total enrolment at the latter was slightly higher than that at government universities.) Student enrolment in Kulaih Kerja Nyata reached 18 500 in 1985 and dropped to 17 500 in 1986. After governmental financial support was stopped in 1986, it was expected to evolve into a local option, as had already occurred in private universities. No information was available to the research team on further developments in this regard. Mexico Servicio Social was started in 1936, initially focusing on health care for rural Mexicans. All medical students were required to serve for six months in communities that did not otherwise have medical services. In 1947, federal law made Servicio Social mandatory for all higher education students. It was not well-developed until 1978, however, when a national coordinating commission for social service for students in higher education was established by government. In 1971 there were 115 institutions of higher education, with 33 000 graduates, of which 67% were said to have completed Servicio Social. These figures are questionable, however, as Servicio Social was not well-developed at the time and did not exist in many places.

According to official estimates, during 1986/87 there were 1,6-million students in institutions of higher education or technical schools, and about

320 000 of these were potential Servicio Social participants. There were 59 000 participants through the commission coordinating social service in higher education during that year. The potential pool in 1987/88 was about 400 000. During that year, the number of students receiving small stipends from the commission increased dramatically to 150 000. The students served at 3 000 separate programme sites. In addition, about 70 000 served without a stipend. Nothing was officially known about the remainder.

Botswana: Due to rapid growth in secondary enrolment and budgetary constraints, not all school leavers can be accommodated; in 1991, 75% of the more than 6 000 school leavers participated. In 1997 there are 6 250 participants.

Israel: The voluntary programme, Perach, had 12 000 participants in 1988. It is unknown what percentage of the student population this represents, but in 1988, 1 500 of the 17 000 students at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem participated and 1 200 of the 6 000 students at Haifa University took part. About 20% of students drop out of the programme each year because of the demands of the tuition work.

USA: The AmeriCorps has more than 25 000 members. Payment of students

In Nigeria and Ghana where graduates are employed in the national service programme they are paid less than they would have earned in nonservice positions. In Ghana graduates are paid a wage slightly below the traditional civil service remuneration and in Nigeria graduates are paid a stipend `somewhat smaller than their expected earnings'.

In Israel and the USA students are able to earn a considerable portion of their fees for higher education through community service. Israeli students can earn up to half their annual tuition fees in their nine months of community service and money is a primary incentive for participation in the programme. However, students are carefully supervised and are paid only after proving they are responsible. AmeriCorps students receive a modest living allowance and health cover while participating in the

programme. After completing a year of service (at least 1 700 hours) the student receives an education award of $4 725. This award can be used to help pay off student loans or to finance tertiary education.

Policy on payment varies considerably in the four countries in which students undertake community service. In Costa Rica payment is prohibited by statute. Many students in Costa Rica object to Trabajo Comunal Universitatio because it requires extra work and often additional financial expenditure by the student. In addition, lack of money to pay students for transport and food often makes it difficult for students to carry out their responsibilities. Although many students were initially paid a minimum wage for their service in Mexico, this was greatly reduced from 1980 after an economic crisis. By 1983/84, the stipends were about 10 to 20% of the minimum wage. During 1987/88, just over one-third of potential participants were receiving a small stipend while another 18% served without a stipend. Nothing was officially known about the other 45%. Government departments and agencies still share in financial support of students, while communities sometimes provide housing and food. Universities also provide funds, sometimes supplemented by nongovernment funding. Students in Nepal are paid a subsistence wage while in Mexico stipends for students vary according to the employing agency. Many government agencies have small stipends to offer and they try to recruit the best students and offer the highest stipends.

Financing

Most of the service programmes surveyed were financed by government - even those managed and administered by higher education institutions. However, government support for these programmes has been considerably influenced by changes in the economy. In most cases government support has been reduced over the years and in two cases (Indonesia and Ghana) it dried up altogether. In Israel the education department is almost entirely responsible for funding the programme. In Nigeria the programme is funded and sponsored by the federal government. Project implementation is highly dependent on this funding and on state and local cooperation in acquiring land and other resources. Private institutions can subsidise a graduate's stipend based on services tendered to that institution. The costs of the programme are considerable, mainly

because of the administration of the programme and the deployment of students to far-away states. The service programme was introduced as part of Indonesia's five-year plan and as such 120 000 rupiahs (US$73) per Kulaih Kerja Nyata student was allocated to government universities from 1979 to 1984. The amount allocated has declined since then due to severe cutbacks in the national budget. The allocation per service programme student was halved in 1985 and reduced to nothing in 1986. Since 1986 universities have bad to accept responsibility for financing.

In Mexico general funding was provided at a national level from 1978. Although many students were initially paid a minimum wage for their service, this was greatly reduced from 1980 following an economic crisis. Government departments and agencies still share in financial support of students, while communities sometimes provide housing and food. Universities also provide funds, sometimes supplemented by nongovernment funding. In Nepal the programme was funded by government through the university budget and supplemented by Unicef. The AmeriCorps programme is an exception to those described above in that the private, public and independent sectors all contribute to the implementation of programmes. In 1994-95 more than 600 businesses and foundations contributed over $20 million in financial support directly to local AmeriCorps programmes. In addition, millions of dollars of in-kind contributions in the form of loaned personnel, training facilities, computer networks, and supplies have integrated private sector partners into the daily activities of AmeriCorps programmes.

Impact on social and national development needs

A number of the service programmes have been evaluated, but these provide little analysis of the impact of the programmes on social or national development. Although Eberly and Sherraden claim to provide a `solid, comparative analysis of service policy and programme performance', they do not provide quantitative data on the impact of the programmes and their claims are often unsourced. Claims made concerning the programmes should therefore be treated with some caution.

Eberly and Sherraden claim that in Nigeria the National Youth Service

Corps has promoted the deployment of skilled manpower around the country. For example, the `NYSC has made it possible for some school systems around the country to have a regular supply of trained teachers' and it `provided the catalyst for the realisation of the universal primary education goals of the mid-1970s'. The youth service corps also increased the supply of qualified lecturers and other personnel to newly created universities and colleges. It helped to deliver the national health service plan by providing qualified personnel for permanent and mobile clinics in rural areas. Finally, the youth service corps is said to have `immensely boosted the pace of rural infrastructural development'.

In Mexico Servicio Social's contributions to rural welfare and development in medicine is said to have been `truly substantial'. Between 1962 and 1972, Servicio Social in medicine was a major source of medical personnel for a growing hospital system. However, outside medicine its largest single impact seems to have been in the area of university-based research.

Eberly claims that evaluations have shown that the Tirelo Setshaba programme in Botswana has had a `marked impact on education' as students acted as teacher aides and enabled untrained teachers to go for training.

No indications of the impact of Kulaih Kerja Nyata in Indonesia are known, nonetheless it is claimed that life in many villages has been improved in respect of water supply, sanitation, health and agricultural methods as a result of the programme.

Albrecht and Ziderman also make claims about the social impact of service programmes in Ghana and Nepal. In Ghana the national service programme is described as having `yielded considerable social benefits', while Nepal's national service development programme is said to have had high societal benefits. Rural school enrolments rose sharply, and literacy levels and living conditions improved. It also served as an important feedback mechanism for university planners and teachers, and for government in respect of rural needs.

The Corporation for National Service in the USA employs extensive and continuous monitoring and evaluation procedures for all its programmes. Every AmeriCorps programme has a plan for internal evaluation. These

plans set goals and ways of tracking progress and improving programme quality. Progress towards goals is monitored by programme officers at the corporation and representatives at state and local level. The first year review of the AmeriCorps programme claims that over the year members `delivered direct and measurable results in the areas of education, public safety, human needs and the environment'. Examples of these results include the following: in Texas 89 AmeriCorps members helped immunise 104 000 infants; in Bozeman, Montana, 32 members built and cleared 119 rniles of nature trails, prevented the erosion of 2 700 feet of trout stream and planted 3 000 trees. In addition to the internal evaluations, outside evaluators have also assessed the impact of AmeriCorps. A study by economists of three representative programmes found that `the return on every federal dollar invested in AmeriCorps should result in $1,60 to $2,60 or more in direct measurable benefits'. Another independent study has documented concrete benefits derived by communities as the result of the AmeriCorps programme, `including backing up members of the New York city police department, fighting forest fires in the west, helping flood-ravaged neighbourhoods from Texas to California to Minnesota, teaching in some of the nation's toughest classrooms, and cleaning up polluted rivers and streams'.

In addition to addressing social and national development needs the service programmes have had other benefits for students, higher education institutions and nations as a whole. For example in Nigeria an opinion survey conducted in 1980 by the planning and evaluation division of the National Youth Service Corps directorate showed that 80% of participants felt it was an opportunity to get to know more about other people and regions. The survey also showed that continued interaction and improved knowledge between corps members and host communities diminished prejudice, biases and scepticism, thereby fostering better understanding between diverse groups and promoting national integration. The Botswana national service scheme is also said to have had a `marked impact on national integration'.

In Indonesia Kulaih Kerja Nyata, which means `learning through real work', is reported to have benefited participants. Educators and officials tend to describe its main outcomes as character building for students. They also talk about improving the motivation of students to make constructive contributions to Indonesia. According to Eberly and

Sherraden, many thousands of students have `experienced the satisfaction of improving life in a village and the growth in character and understanding that comes from living with rural families. Also the emphasis on linking upwardly mobile young people with the villages has been generally successful.'

Programme descriptions also suggest that students gain professional skills, work experience and civic skills and knowledge during community service. In the case of university-managed and administered service the experience is very uneven and depends on faculty and institutional organisation.

The voluntary programmes in Israel and the USA also report benefits for participants. Eberly and Sherraden report that Perach `provides good training for students, and for some, excellent pre-career experience'. The AmeriCorps programme claims that participants not only assist individuals and communities but `gain valuable experience, specialised training and life skills'.

Constraints

In addition to resistance by students, a number of service programmes experienced the following problems:

- Corruption in programme administration and financing;

- Insufficient funds;

- Insufficient placements for effective service;

- Ineffective supervision;

- A wide variety of quality and programme design across higher education institutions in the same country;

- Unemployment resulted in students benefiting rather than the programmes exacting payment; and

- The use of programmes for political favours and patronage.

Ghana: Macroeconomic difficulties in the 1980s, combined with a rapid increase in the supply of graduates, changed the labour market situation.

In a era of unemployment, the programme actually provided additional benefit to students rather than exacting `payment'.

Nepal: The programme became politically controversial with students becoming tools for newly emerging political parties and being regarded by government as a disruptive force. In 1980 the programme was abandoned, but in the early 1990s the government was considering reinstating it.

Costa Rica: Constraints include a lack of supervision, difficulty in diagnosing available resources and priorities, and a lack of motivation among students. Furthermore, the service programme was not included in the study plan and suffered from a lack of finance. It was found that the 300 hours allocated were insufficient to achieve results. Students were sometimes unprepared, did not identify with the community problem and lacked the necessary methodological skills to apply knowledge in the community. As part of planned reforms in programme design, students began to study particular problems from 1988 and projects were to be tied to these studies.

Indonesia: Funding has been a major problem, and government support will be forthcoming only if there is an increase in oil revenues or rapid economic growth.

There was also substantial opposition to the programme with some opponents wanting it stopped, and others preferring to see a service programme conducted independently of the university because they felt it interfered too much with students' academic programmes. The two-month service period was an uneasy compromise between these views and had several drawbacks: it diminished the impact on the student and on village development, and heightened the cost per month of service.

Nigeria: The National Youth Service Corps had difficulty recruiting and retaining the right calibre of staff and suffered from financial constraints. Students were resistant to serving in places far from home. The programme also suffered from a lack of permanent orientation camps, a lack of accommodation, the underutilisation of professional skills, and a lack of employment prospects for discharged members. The youth service corps now urges members to create their own employment.

Botswana: `Lack of acceptability by urban people' seems to be a constraint, as is the fact that the number of school leavers exceeds the capacity to absorb them into national development activities.

Mexico: Constraints in this country include the following:

• Limited and irregular funding;

• Little concrete knowledge about the programme among the public;

• Except for medicine, little service to the rural poor. This issue is related to resources: without stipends, students cannot afford to go to the countryside. Outside medicine, education, architecture and social work, however, it does not generally serve the urban poor either;

• Sometimes limited commitment by students, in part because they receive poor information, poor choices of service placements, and inadequate supervision;

• The autonomy of universities, and schools and departments within universities, makes regularisation difficult; and

• The programme requires too much paperwork.

Nevertheless the full potential of the programme could be realised if the commission on social service succeeds in regularising and coordinating Servicio Social into a coherent national programme applied to all disciplines in all institutions. Already, organisation and coordination has been improved, leading to greater coherence and stability in the programme.

Although service in nonmedical fields has not had the same impact as those in medical fields, it is possible that the successful medical example might eventually influence the structure and effectiveness of service in other professions and academic disciplines.

SECTION FOUR

SOUTH AFRICAN PRACTICE IN COMPARISON WITH INTERNATIONAL EXPERIENCE

Most of the international examples of community service in higher education have been initiated by government in service of national development goals. In South Africa most of the service programmes are initiated within higher education institutions and take place as isolated local projects.

Of the nine international programmes examined during this research process, seven were initiated by the governments of their respective countries (Nigeria, Ghana, Costa Rica, Mexico, Nepal, Indonesia and Botswana). In all of these, except for Botswana, service was compulsory and was introduced on a national basis, not through individual line ministries. Each of these programmes operated in service of national development priorities. With the exception of Mexico, the programmes were either guided by a national development framework or formed part of a long-term national plan for development. Where government was not driving the programme itself, the framework or plan governed the priorities and decisions of individual institutions responsible for operating the service programme. In the case of Mexico service is a widely accepted ideal, deeply rooted in the communal values of the indigenous population and the Mexican Revolution. However, the programme is not guided by an overarching governmental framework and has spiralled into uneven provision. Two countries introduced service programmes on a voluntary basis (Israel and the USA). Both were initiated and funded by government and operate within a national framework although they are locally coordinated,

In South Africa all the higher education service programmes are initiated within institutions - either by the institution as a whole, or by individual faculties or departments, or by stakeholders within the institutions (such

as students and/or staff). The programmes are mostly mission-driven in that they seek to express the central higher education mission of teaching and research in new, community-based contexts. Some of the programmes are needs-related in that they shape extension services in relation to community needs, or take community needs as the reference point to influence teaching and research. Three of the South African programmes are needs-driven: Sasvo, Shawco and Uskor aim to cater directly for specific needs of the communities in which they operate, regardless of whether or not this fosters the higher education mission.

Consequently, the South African programmes cannot be said to be operating within a national development framework. Although the reconstruction and development programme was intended to set out such a national framework, it has fallen away as a key strategy both as a result of the national settlement and because government has concentrated on other priorities such as the growth, employment and redistribution (Gear) strategy. The service programmes in higher education are thus operating as disparate activities which are locally focused and do not relate systematically to national development priorities.

The international programmes generally aim far national outreach. They may be organised by government or may devolve implementation to higher education institutions. By contrast, South African programmes are currently institution-based and locally focused.

The international examples are organised and managed in different ways, but are national in their orientation. In some cases government initiates, organises and supervises the service programmes - either centrally or by devolving operational responsibility to state secretariats. In other cases government sets the framework and provides the resources, but leaves the organisation, management and supervision to a nongovernmental secretariat or to higher education institutions. This model of devolution occurs in compulsory and noncompulsory programmes. In the USA, for example, the Corporation for National Service sets guidelines, chooses programmes for support and monitors outcomes, but programmes are locally managed and coordinated.

In South Africa the service programmes in higher education are organised from the base of individual institutions and tend to be locally focused, even in cases where the locus of work is some distance away from the institution itself (eg. the Wits Rural Facility operates in one area in Mpumalanga while the main campus is in Gauteng).

Given the fragmented nature of the activities in South African higher education service programmes, a huge leap would be required to move from the current situation to one in which higher education human resources (staff and students) could be deployed to address national goals (eg. skills shortages), as was done in Nigeria, Indonesia, Ghana or Nepal, for instance. The following factors are important in this regard:

• South Africa's only comprehensive experience of national service has been the South African Defence Force which conscripted white youth into the army in service of unjust causes under apartheid. This experience has discredited the idea of national conscription and has left a legacy whereby national service is viewed with suspicion. Within this context the notion of `academic conscription' generates considerable resistance among student and youth organisations, despite calls that community service be made compulsory for all students. In South Africa there may be considerable resistance to an authoritarian system in which young people are required to work for stipends or low wages. Furthermore, participants are likely to want a choice in terms of where they work and how far away from their families they are likely to be placed. A culture of service would need to develop within the country whereby members of the public recognise the value of student and staff deployment into underserved areas, and the participants come to accept that despite the inconveniences, there is merit in making a social contribution through service;

• Deployment into low-skill tasks regardless of the students' field of study may meet resistance on two grounds. First, many students do not want to do domestic or manual work because of the stigma attached to such activities. Second, high levels of unemployment in South Africa create a dilemma for decision-makers: do they deploy students into programmes that clear alien vegetation or undertake labour-based construction, pay them and thereby support students in need of

financial aid, or do they offer these opportunities to unemployed people in local communities?

- A great deal of planning, coordination and, above all, financing would be required to achieve the critical mass necessary for service activities to constitute a coherent effort designed to achieve national development goals.

The impact of service programmes is difficult to quantify both in the international examples and in South Africa. Where substantial impact is claimed in other countries, it seems to have been achieved through a number of strategies.

Although the impact analysis of programmes in the nine countries outside South Africa should be treated with some caution, the literature suggests that the use of service for national development has had benefits. Examples include the following: the National Youth Service Corps in Nigeria made it possible for some school systems around the country to have a regular supply of trained teachers and provided the catalyst for realising the universal primary education goals of the mid-1970s. Through the national service development programme of Nepal, school enrolments rose sharply, and literacy levels and living conditions improved. The Nepalese programme also served as an important feedback mechanism for university planners and teachers, and for government in respect of rural needs. In Botswana the Tirelo Setshaba programme had a `marked impact on education' as students acted as teacher aides and enabled untrained teachers to go for training.

Some of the countries recognised the impact of the programmes in terms of the benefits to participants. For example, educators and officials in Indonesia describe the main outcomes of the Kulaih Kerja Nyata programme as character building for the students and increasing their motivation to contribute constructively to Indonesia. Benefits also accrued to other stakeholders: the governments of these countries were credited with improving the lives of their citizens; the higher education staff benefited from new research ideas and projects, research assistance rendered by participating students, exposure to unfamiliar conditions, and were able to adjust their curricula and teaching methodologies on the

basis of their involvement in the service programmes. In some cases the students were paid for participating (although in many cases the stipends were well below the minimum wage and their work did not constitute employment); they were able to obtain their degrees by virtue of having participated in the service programme; they also gained a number of other benefits such as work experience, maturity, professional knowledge and skills; and learnt to work with people who live in different circumstances (eg. in villages).

In these and other examples, government provided the framework, funding and sometimes the actual plan within which the service programmes functioned. Governments have also used incentives and penalties to increase participation: in the USA and Israel, participation is voluntary and students earn financial credit towards tuition in exchange for participating in the service programmes. Both countries experience high levels of employment and can afford to provide payment incentives for student participation. In the case of the countries where service is compulsory, the penalties for nonparticipation have been severe: in Indonesia, Nepal and Costa Rica, service is a requirement for graduation and students are not able to obtain their degrees without serving the required time. In Nigeria students graduate, but cannot be employed without having done the requisite national service.

In South Africa the research done for this project has not been able to quantify the impact which the services described are having on the scale of need. More research is required on how, as a result of these interventions, conditions are changing in the communities concerned. As pointed out earlier in this paper, the impression given by the available information is that the impact is small in relation to the enormous need in most South African communities. The conclusion from this research is that students, staff and in some cases the institutions are the major beneficiaries of the service programmes and that the benefits for communities flow out of these, but that their impact cannot be quantified at present.

The relationship between the scale of a service programme and its impact may depend on the nature of the need being addressed.

Core issues arising in the international and South African case studies are the following:

- Is impact is increased by virtue of increasing the number of people involved in the service programme?

- Is impact increased through the strategic matching of human resources and skill to the needs identified?

- Or is impact a function of the appropriate solution to the problem identified?

In some cases it would appear that the combination of national mobilisation and development objectives was the reason for the large developmental changes referred to above. At the same time (as was mentioned earlier), the studies do not comment on the quality of the impact. For example, the mobilisation of large numbers often makes it difficult to match deployment with the field of study in which students and staff are involved, and this may lead to wastage or, in some cases, reduced impact. Furthermore, the evidence suggests that there are some countries using this model which could not always place all eligible candidates. Botswana, Indonesia, Mexico and Nigeria had difficulty placing all candidates, either because of insufficient places being available or because the programmes did not have the financial resources or sufficient organisation to maximise the placements. In some instances it would also seem that the strategy of national mobilisation was inefficient: in the case of Mexico in 1987/88 the potential pool of students was 400 000, of whom 150 000 participated in service projects. While the number of participants was less than half the potential number, a substantial number of people's efforts were directed towards service provision. However, an assessment of the same programme notes that it was in the field of medicine that the greatest impact was made, and this would have been a function of matching the skills of senior medical students with the needs of the communities for health care.

Our tentative conclusion here is that the relationship between scale and impact may in fact be a function of the nature of the need and the strategies

required to meet it. If the need requires labour-based activity, then large numbers may make a big difference, eg. in the case of immunising large numbers of children against diseases. If meeting the need requires applying skill, technology and specialist knowledge then the numbers are likely to be less important than matching the available human resources strategically with the task. Finally, the need may best be met by means of an appropriate solution: in the case of the University of the Western Cape a small number of students working as library assistants were able to make a huge impact on the functioning of the institution by keeping the library open between 8pm and 10pm.

An additional factor concerns the amount of time available for service. The impact of a service programme may be more substantial if skilled personnel have more time (eg. 9 or 12 months) in which to deliver the programme. Where it is not necessary to match skill with need, a wide variety of short-term projects may yield the desired outcome.

Government support for community service is closely related to its economic strength.

Most of the service programmes in the international survey were financed by government- even those managed and administered by higher education institutions. However, government support for these programmes has been considerably influenced by changes in the economy: in most cases government support was reduced over the years and in two cases (Indonesia and Ghana) dried up altogether. Where countries could no longer afford to maintain national service programmes, the programmes collapsed or were reduced to small, institution-based operations. Funding partnerships were noted in only two cases: the Nepalese government received some supplementary support from the United Nations Children's Fund (Unicef) for its national service scheme, while the AmeriCorps programme funding is derived not only from the federal government, but also from the corporate sector and private foundations in the USA.

The extent to which programmes reach the poorest communities is also a function of the funds available: the costs of the Nigerian programme were raised considerably by the commitment to deploy students to outlying parts of the country. In the case of Costa Rica, the requirement that 75%

of programme funds come from the communities themselves limited the outreach of the programme to those communities that could afford to part with these resources.

The international case studies suggest that nowhere did community service constitute a form of employment for students. In most cases students were paid below the minimum wage and in some cases they received no payment at all. In one case students were not remunerated and had to meet their own expenses (eg. transport costs), with the result that they were contributing financially to the programme in which they were required to serve.

The programmes in Israel and the USA relate payment for participation to tuition cost. In these cases the costs to government may be higher per participant than in other countries, and it is thus not surprising that in both Israel and the USA the issue of cost-benefit is one which informs the assessment of impact.

In South Africa none of the programmes surveyed were receiving government support. It appears that two programmes (Sasvo and Shawco) might have accessed reconstruction and development programme funding for aspects of their programmes (such as school rebuilding and primary school nutrition projects), but this could not be confirmed. The South African programmes ate thus heavily dependent on external funding from companies and foundations inside the country; and from support from foreign donors. In some cases the higher education institutions contribute to funding, but very few programmes are able to rely entirely on financial support from their institution.

Since government is unlikely to have the funds to launch a large-scale national service programme, it must be envisaged that for the foreseeable future institutions will have to depend on leveraging funding from the private sector, from donors, and possibly from line ministries for specific human resource development programmes (see introduction). This is likely to make coordination and coherence more difficult to achieve since it places continued responsibility for programme design and resourcing at the level of individual institutions. Nevertheless it was suggested during the course of the research that the Council on Higher Education could play a role in increasing coherence in the institutional efforts towards

community service programmes, and that regional cooperation between institutions could help to maximise the impact of scarce resources.

The impact of community service on higher education curricula is greater in South Africa than in other countries.

In four of the countries surveyed (Mexico, Nepal, Costa Rica and Indonesia) the service programmes have some relationship with the academic programme in which students participate, but in a number of cases the academic credit gained was for participation in its own right rather than for the match between the service performed and the impact on the student's field of study. In general it would seem that the programmes tend to concentrate on deploying large numbers of students, regardless of whether their skills and fields of study are appropriate for the tasks performed.

In South Africa a much closer relationship between community service and fields of study is developing. This is being fostered by the push for the transformation of higher education, and by the need to prepare students adequately for new occupations and for the world of work. The programmes surveyed show that in a number of institutions serious attempts are being made to link curricula more meaningfully with conditions in communities off campus and that extension/outreach and curriculum-related programmes are feeding back into curriculum design.

SECTION FIVE

NATIONAL SERVICE IN SOUTH AFRICA: FROM PAST EXPERIENCE TO CURRENT PROPOSALS

The concept of `national service' is a contested one in the South African context. Under apartheid the government's use of the military to subjugate

South Africans and to destabilise the southern African region has left a close association between the term `national service' and the effects of apartheid. In the 1990s, with the advent of democracy in South Africa, attempts were made within sections of civil society to give the term a new meaning which was more synergistic with the aims of the new dispensation. This section examines briefly how the term `national service' has evolved in recent years in the South African context, and what goals are being articulated in proposals for national community service.

The South African Defence Force

For most South Africans the most recent and enduring experience of national service is that which was practised under apartheid. The South African Defence Force conscripted young white men into the army to defend unjust causes inside and outside South Africa. The periods of service varied (first for nine months and then for longer periods, up to two years), and soldiers were paid a stipend for the period they spent in uniform. To all intents and purposes the national servicemen were used for narrow political purposes in actions frequently hidden from the public eye. `National service' was a compulsory national programme, driven by central government (not the function of a specific line ministry), and is thus associated in the minds of many South Africans with repressive actions and militaristic tendencies. The experience has discredited the idea of national conscription and has left a legacy in which the concept of a centrally driven national service is viewed with suspicion by many South Africans.

The National Youth Service Initiative

Following the prominent role played by young black people in mass mobilisation during the 1970s and 1980s, the 1990s saw a second phase in the organisation of young people. This latter period sought to address the condition of the youth as a group of people alienated from society and in particular need of support and attention if they were to be reintegrated into the civic, educational and economic mainstream. At its launch in 1993 the National Youth Development Forum drew support not only from more than 100 youth organisations, but also from a range of other stakeholders - sporting bodies, teacher organisations, trade unions and business associations. In the months leading up to the launch, an intensive study sought to design a programme through which the education, training and development needs of young people could be met in conjunction with their productive involvement in service initiatives designed to contribute to national reconstruction and development. First thought of as a `national youth service corps', the programme was launched as the National Youth Service Initiative, and was intended to function as the flagship of the National Youth Development Forum.

The National Youth Service Initiative is an important development in the continuum along which the concept of national service has evolved in South Africa in recent years. At the outset the initiative sought to distance itself from the past experiences of national service under apartheid. It did this by locating itself squarely within the national reconstruction and development agenda, by introducing the notion of community service (as opposed to national service) and by rejecting any association with the military. In fact the rejection of the term `national youth service corps' was not only an expression of antipathy towards militaristic terminology; it was a vitally important shift in emphasis in development terms. `The original approach suggested a process of forming young people into orderly groups and then finding tasks for them to do. The present approach focuses on identifying needs and opportunities and mobilising young people to respond to and be engaged in meeting those needs.'[7]

---

[7]A National Youth Service Initiative in South Africa. Report by the technical team under the leadership of Bob Tucker to the national working group of the National Youth Development Forum. September 1993, p.4.

The essence of the National Youth Service Initiative's approach was twofold: to render service through projects and simultaneously to educate, train and develop the young participants by means of a core curriculum. Here then, in 1993, was the first articulation of the relationship between service and learning in the South African context and it was occurring outside the context of structured education provision. The programme stressed the need to balance implementability, scale, the engagement of youth, and the delivery of a quality programme for the benefit both of the young participants and for the development of the communities concerned. The sectors that the planning team identified for this purpose were the following: immediate rehabilitation of urban and rural infrastructure; long-term urban infrastructure and housing; education and training; rural development and rural environmental conservation; health; social services; and peace service.

The programme had some of the hallmarks of those national service programmes which were launched in other countries (as detailed in section 4 above) - service periods of six months to two years and a daily stipend paid for work done. There were also important differences in design: participation was to be voluntary and young people would be encouraged to participate in projects in the communities in which they lived. The greatest difference, however, lay in the fact that this programme was being launched from a civil society base, not by government, although close interaction and partnerships with government at both national and local level were envisaged, and it was hoped that on the basis of visible results, government would in fact earmark financial support for the scheme.

Ultimately the collapse of the National Youth Development Forum in June 1995 meant that the National Youth Service Initiative experience was short-lived. Despite shaky beginnings (partly as a consequence of inexperienced management and insecure funding, as well as difficulty in striking sustainable partnerships in the transitional dispensation), a brief assessment of the early stages of the programme[8] suggests that the initiative did generate projects which, with the help of government, may have been sustainable. It also noted that the programme had strong partnership

[8]Gardner Khumalo et al: Youth Development Policy: Prospects and Pitfall,. Research report by the Centre for Policy Studies, commissioned by the petitions and public participation committee of the Gauteng legislature, 1 December 1995, pp. 55-G3.

component of the traditional training through articles: `Internship would be acceptable, but not as a replacement to articles.... There would not be enough training or exposure of attorneys to legal practices ... there is a problem of black graduates not getting articles, but that could be sorted out by a change of attitude of law firms.'[11]

These two responses suggest that the notion of service needs to be disentangled from two other issues: jobs for black law graduates, and appropriate training. The question that arises is who the prime beneficiaries of the scheme will be: the new graduates, the broader society or the specific communities in which the interns work? A complicating factor concerns the value of the service to be offered by the new graduates: responses to the proposal for law internship as well as to Health Minister Nkosazana Zuma's proposal for medical internship have pointed to the need for supervision of new graduates if they are to render a valuable service to the public, and to the costs thereof.

Nevertheless, one factor that strengthens the motivation for the proposal is that many of the professions are not geared towards steering newly qualified professionals towards public service. Consequently, there are still relatively few opportunities during their training, or on graduation, for young professionals to be exposed to new career opportunities in development work. Where such opportunities have been made available, the research found a number of cases in which students switched career paths to public service work after having been exposed to practising in a development context. [12]

One of the significant aspects of the law proposal is that it originated in civil society rather than being initiated by government. While government clearly supports the proposal, the involvement of civil society as initiator is an important step in changing the orientation of the public, and professionals among them, towards being more supportive of the notion of rendering service as part of the national effort of reconstruction and development.

[11]Jimmy Yesiko, Western Cape director of the Black Lawyers' Association as quoted in the Mail and Guardian, 1-7 August 1997.

[12]Some of the most striking examples of this phenomenon come from the University of Natal in Pietermaritzburg where, on the basis of exposure to development work during their undergraduate careers, graduates in a range of fields switched to public interest work following their practica served in the private sector.

SECTION SIX

COMMUNITY SERVICE AND THE CHALLENGES FACING HIGHER EDUCATION

The higher education sector in South Africa has been the focus of intensive deliberation regarding its role in the growth and development of the country. In August 1997 the Cabinet adopted the White Paper on Higher Education[13] which identifies at least four major deficiencies in higher education:

- The inequitable distribution of access and opportunity: higher education is characterised by gross inequalities of access for students and staff along lines of race, class, gender and geography;

- The inadequate response by higher education to the development needs of society: there is a serious mismatch between the output of higher education and the needs of a modernising economy;

- Higher education has failed to lay the foundations for a critical civil society: it has failed to contribute to the socialisation of enlightened, responsible and constructively critical citizens, and has not actively encouraged individuals to make commitments to common societal goals; and

- Inappropriate policies and practices in teaching and research: in many parts of the higher education system teaching, learning and research practices and policies favour academic insularity and inhibit the contribution that higher education can make to local, regional and national development needs in South Africa.

[13]Department of Education, A Programme for the Transformation of Higher Education ion, Pretoria, July 1997. Government Gazette, vol 386, no 18207.

The transformation strategy spelled out in the White Paper is designed to produce a higher education system in South Africa in which these deficiencies are addressed. The strategy includes the following components:

Equitable participation

The White Paper provides the basis for policies designed to ensure that the higher education system over time reflects the demographic realities of the broader SA society. These will have to include provision for articulation and transfer between the different structures and sectors of the higher education system, and provision for support for those whose private or family resources prevent them gaining access to higher education.

Responsiveness

According to the White Paper, learning programmes, rather than institutions, should be the basic building blocks of the South African higher education system. It aims to diversify curricula with a view to removing obstacles which unnecessarily limit the access of learners to higher education; to develop a flexible learning system; to improve the responsiveness of the higher education system to national and provincial needs; to enhance the personal development of learners in the system; and to loosen the grip which single academic disciplines have on higher education qualifications in SA.

Partnerships

The White Paper stresses that major changes are required in the structures, values and culture of higher education governance in South Africa, and argues for the adoption of partnerships between government and civil society organisations through which the challenges of a modern society can be met. The civil society groupings involved in these partnerships should include higher education institutions, organised business, commerce and labour, and other stakeholders such as staff and student organisations.

Community service in higher education policy

The White Paper makes some specific references to the role of community service within the overarching task of transforming higher education:

- One of the national goals of the higher education sector is cited as being `to promote and develop social responsibility and awareness among students of the role of higher education in social and economic development through community service programmes ;[14]

- At institutional level, the goals include `to demonstrate social responsibility of institutions and their commitment to the common good by making available expertise and infrastructure for community service programmes;[15] and

- `The ministry is highly receptive to the grouting interest in community service programmes for students, to harness the social commitment and energy of young people to the needs of the reconstruction and development programme, and as a potential component of the national student financial aid scheme. The ministry will consult the Council for Higher Education and the National Youth Commission on this matter. In principle, the ministry will encourage suitable feasibility studies and pilot programmes which explore the potential of community service:

  - ? to answer the call of young people for constructive social engagement;

  - ? to enhance the culture of learning, teaching and service in higher education; and

  - ? to relieve some of the financial burden of study at this level.'[16]

These references suggest that community service is regarded as a vehicle for developing a stronger sense of social commitment in students and for encouraging a sense of service within the higher education institutions (thereby increasing their responsiveness to community need). They also suggest that community service performed in lieu of payment may help to alleviate students' financial need. The policy thus seems to be looking to the concept of community service as a means of reorientating students

[14]Department of Education, op cit, section 1.27(8).
[15]Ibis, section 1.28(5).
[16]Ibid section 2.36.

and higher education institutions towards a stronger public service outlook. The question that arises is who the primary beneficiaries are likely to be. The formulation suggests that students and the institutions are likely to be the prime beneficiaries of community service programmes and that care would need to be taken to ensure that such benefit is not accrued at the community's expense.[17]

The challenge of responsiveness

How do these social and developmental goals fit with the higher education mission? A limited survey of higher education institution mission statements was undertaken during the research process. It found that at the core of most of the mission statements is a commitment to quality teaching, scholarship and research which is responsive to the developmental needs of individuals and society at large. Some refer to higher education's service to society and its contribution towards the reconstruction and development processes in South Africa. Others emphasise higher education's role in addressing the challenges facing society in general. The White Paper's references to community service are broadly consonant with the mission statements emanating from various higher education institutions.

What, then, are the distinctive ways in which higher education institutions could give expression to this aspect of their mission? There appear to be two broad approaches, neither of which see service delivery as a distinctive function of higher education, except when it is part of the training of students (for example, in law or in the health sciences):

• One locates teaching and research at the core of the mission and therefore responds to societal needs through these functions. In this way responsiveness to societal needs can be integrated into the mainstream activities of higher education, with the potential to transform relationships between higher education and society; and

• The alternative approach sees community service as a distinctive, third leg of higher education's mission. This suggests that responsiveness to societal needs might become an add-on activity, peripheral to the core business of teaching and research.

---

[17]The White Paper does not define the term `community', nor does it suggest how the service programmes could be of direct benefit to the wider community.

The analysis of South African case studies in section 3 shows that institutions are already seeking to respond to the social and developmental imperatives within communities, but that these efforts are still sporadic and do not yet constitute the critical mass necessary to make a significant impact on the relationships between higher education and society. The research process nevertheless identified a number of positive factors which have considerable potential to support the growth of a culture of service in this new environment:

- The higher education policy framework will facilitate coordination and partnership between institutions. For example, regional consortia of higher education institutions do not necessarily work cooperatively to share their experience and scarce resources in respect of new projects such as service learning. The Council for Higher Education will be an important entity in driving the process whereby the necessary resources, will and capacity can be placed behind curriculum transformation and the development of a service ethic;

- Although many institutions are struggling with limited capacity and are facing the challenges of transformation on all fronts simultaneously, the research shows that the strategic application of small amounts of resources can be enormously influential in strengthening the pockets of change which do exist within institutions;

- Professional bodies are likely to play an important role in increasing the momentum for curriculum change and pushing for greater institutional responsiveness to economic and social development needs;

- Although there has traditionally been a reluctance in certain disciplines to pay attention to the development of transferable skills, the introduction of outcomes-based education in the national education system is likely to focus more on achieving applied competences in all disciplines; and

- The South African Qualifications Authority's role in quality assurance is likely to be very influential in achieving transferable skills which can be reinforced and augmented by any form of work experience.

Community service and financial aid

The centrality of financial aid in achieving the goals of massifying access to higher education is clear from virtually all the documentation consulted throughout this research process. However, a range of differentiated funding strategies will be required if the massive need for financial assistance is to be met.

The White Paper takes the following position:

`*Annual budgetary allocations are only one element in a complex equation, and the ministry accepts that a multifaceted approach to student financial aid is essential. A sustainable long-term scheme will include loans and bursaries, as the present scheme does, and may well include scholarships to reward academic excellence, and student and community self-reliance programmes, such as workstudy and community service. The ministry is actively supporting an investigation into there alternatives.'* [18]

A survey conducted in 1995 for the National Commission on Higher Education on student financial aid in South Africa estimated that 70 000 students in the universities and technikons needed financial support. This figure is now estimated to be 80 000. If the college sector is added to this, the figure rises to more than 100 000. The 1995 study projected the financial need at R900m for 1996. In 1997/98 it is closer to R1 000m (R1 bn). [19]

The funding available for student support comes from a range of sources and has the following profile:

Higher education institutions	R220m[20]
Government	300m
Tertiary Education Fund of South Africa (Tefsa)	60m
Family contributions	150m
Total	730m

[18]Department of Education, A Programme for the Transformation of Higher Education, Pretoria, July 1997.

[19]This and the following information was gained from a discussion with Prof Ian Bunting and others at the University of Cape Town during the course of the research process.

[20]This includes private sector and other donations secured by institutions.

If the need is estimated at Rl 000m in 1997, there is thus a shortfall of about R270m. From the students' perspective, Tefsa funding covers only a part of their student fees (eg. at some institutions in 1996/97 students may each owe R20 000, while Tefsa is able to provide only about R8 000 a student) leaving each student with a considerable shortfall. As a result, most higher education institutions are carrying high levels of student debt. By absorbing student debt they are eating into their funding derived annually from government and donors, and are unable to improve or expand the system.

Government's contribution to the national student financial aid scheme is likely to be made annually, but at this stage it is not clear whether the contribution is likely to increase in size, whether it will form part of the higher education budget, or whether it will be drawn from resources outside this budget. What is clear is that the national student financial aid scheme is unlikely to be augmented through endowments-either from government or the private sector.

Given the interest that the White Paper on Higher Education takes in community service as one option for financial aid, what possibilities are there for shaping service programmes in ways that will generate the financial resources needed by higher education students?

Options for linking service and financial aid

In January 1995 a national conference was held on student financing in higher education. Since then, and over the past two years, a number of commentators have identified community service as a mechanism that can expand financial aid resources to higher education students. For example, Dr Pundy Pillay wrote that `community service is another cost-recovery measure that can be usefully considered. It could move governments beyond explicitly financial instruments to exact payment from graduates in areas of high social value, as a means of partially paying off the costs of their higher education. In many countries, including South Africa, there are serious personnel shortages particularly in such areas as rural health care and teaching. Graduates are usually unwilling to perform these tasks in rural areas, at least, in the numbers that society deems necessary. A partial solution is to require recent graduates to perform a

period of national service in one of these socially productive employment areas, perhaps for two years after graduation as a form of partial repayment for their educadon.'[21]

Another contributor, Bronwyn Levy, [22] commented that `community service schemes allow graduates to provide a service to society in areas of value as a way of paying for part of the costs of higher education. These schemes have advantages in that they could direct graduates into areas of critical need where there is an undersupply of person power'.

Dr Stuart Saunders[23] cites Albrecht and Ziderman who point out that national service can be justified by the fact that it is society as a whole, through taxation, that subsidises higher education and that the graduate gets a personal gain which justifies repayment in kind through service to society As has been shown elsewhere in this paper, a national service scheme may take place after graduation or may coincide with undergraduate study. Repayment in kind is usually separated completely from institutional finances or may occasionally directly benefit the financial position of the higher education institution, for example when students are employed by the institution in workstudy arrangements such as those outlined in section 3. In some instances, there is direct payment to students in lieu of tuition or living support such as in the case of the programmes in the Western Cape and KwaZulu-Natal (see section 3).

Graduates enrolled in service programmes can repay their debts to society in one of two ways: If the graduates are paid below market wage levels in certain posts, for example in the civil service, then the differential between the regular wage and their earnings constitutes a repayment for subsidised higher education. For example, in Botswana the students are paid a wage 5% below normal. Alternatively, students can be employed at market rates, but in posts that are important to society and cannot be filled, for example, teachers and doctors in rural areas. [24]

[21]Pundy Pillay, 1995: `Student Financing in Higher Education: Funding and Implementing a National Loan Scheme in South Africa' in Higher Eduradon Financing Conference: Background Reading and Conference Papers, January 1995, Ministry of National Education, Pretoria.

[22]Bronwyn Levy, 1995: `Student Loan Programmes - the International Experience', ibid, p. 21 of her paper.

[23]Dr Smart Saunders was consulted by the research team in July 1997 on his current research into financial aid options for higher education.

If national service were to be linked to financial aid, a number of issues would need to be addressed in terms of programme design. These include the possibility that students can `buy out' at the outset by paying higher tuition fees. This might be socially divisive and the programmes would lose much of their potential to generate individual benefits in relation to personal development. Furthermore, unless there is a match between the fields of study like engineering and the service tasks required, graduates may not be best used in terms of society's needs and the cost-benefit may ultimately not be realised.

In the context of transforming higher education in South Africa, there are two key questions that need to be addressed: Firstly, how could the scheme ease the funding needed for the national student financial aid scheme and secondly, how could it be organised and administered? Graduates will need to be paid if they are going to work for one, two or three years in a community service programme. Saunders argues that the only way in which this can be of financial benefit to government is if there are vacant posts which cannot be filled and which are already funded, or if the students work for less than the going rate. Although neither of these strategies would help the national student financial aid scheme recover its debt and maintain its capital base, it is possible that this approach could inform specific schemes for specific sectors.

For example, all medical students who require financial assistance could use a separate scheme rather than turning to the national scheme to cover their education costs. In return, they could be required to work in government posts (national or provincial) for a period of time. The proposal that from 1998 medical graduates would have to do one or two

---

[24] Government departments have cited severe personnel shortages in key areas of health, social welfare, education and legal assistance. In some departments there is not so much a net shortage of personnel as a maldistribution across geographic areas. For example, there is an oversupply of teachers in some provinces while there are chronic shortages of teachers in rural areas in the Northern Province and parts of KwaZulu-Natal. In the field of health there is one doctor for every 700 citizens in some provinces while in the Eastern Cape there is one doctor for every 4 000 residents. The Eastern Cape NIEC for Health and Welfare Services reported in April 1997 that only 38 640 posts of the 52 100 in the sector were filled. She said that some backlogs were critical and in some cases `there was not a single doctor in an isolated rural hospital, no pharmacist in big ones, no social worker to visit an abused child'. The national Department of Welfare also reports widespread backlogs in providing services.

years compulsory service as a condition of their registration as medical practitioners has already been discussed. Since this is regarded as part of their training by the Interim South African Medical and Dental Council, it might be necessary to allow medical graduates to get the value of two years' financial aid credited to them for each additional year of national service after their compulsory two years. In other words, a student who had received loans for all six years of his/her study could then do two years compulsory service as would all other medical graduates, and another three years to pay off his/her student debt. These graduates could be allowed the option of buying out from the last three years, by refunding the agency in full with interest, which would mean that there would be no loss to the financial strength of that scheme.

If the scheme were to be administered by the national Department of Health, then graduates could be required to do their additional national service anywhere in the country. If the scheme were to be run by the provinces, graduates could be required to undertake the service in those provinces. Another possibility is for all students in a particular province who want loans to undertake medical studies anywhere in the country, being required to obtain the loans from their own provincial Department of Health, and to work subsequently for that department.

To what extent could this approach ease the pressure on the national student financial aid scheme? If 5 000 medical students each take loans equivalent to R10 000 a year for six years, this would amount to R50 million a year or R300 million over six years. Since the current estimate of funding available from Tefsa in 1997 is R60 million and from government is R300 million, a reduction of R50 million advanced by another scheme would, to some extent, ease the pressure on the national student financial aid scheme.

If this approach proves acceptable to the medical students, it may be possible to develop an equivalent scheme for lawyers working in the Department of justice, as well as for accountants and other business graduates working in the Department of Finance and elsewhere in the civil service, etc. In the field of teaching this approach is already well-established: for many years colleges of education have required in-service work in return for bursaries.

One major constraint to this approach, however, may be that financial aid schemes applied to medical, engineering, accounting and teaching students could potentially weaken a national student financial aid scheme because their students have the potential to be more reliable with regard to repayment on graduating into these professions. This may aggravate the prospects of debt recovery in the national financial aid scheme even further and may consequently reduce the incentive for government and private donors to increase support for the national scheme.

Fostering community commitment

International experience of community service suggests that many programmes generated increased commitment to community development and to social development in general. As was pointed out in section 4, an opinion survey conducted in 1980 by the Nigerian planning and evaluation division of the National Youth Service Corps directorate showed that 80% of participants felt it provided an opportunity to improve their knowledge of other peoples and regions. The survey also showed that continued interaction and improved knowledge between corps members and host communities diminished prejudice, biases and scepticism, thereby fostering better understanding between diverse groups and contributing to national integration. The Botswana national service scheme is also said to have had a `marked impact on national integration'.

In Indonesia, Kulaih Kerja Nyata is reported to have benefited participants. Educators and officials describe its main outcomes as building character in the students and improving their motivation to contribute constructively to Indonesia. According to Eberly and Sherraden, many thousands of students have `experienced the satisfaction of improving life in a village and the growth in character and understanding that comes from living with rural families. Also the emphasis on linking upwardly mobile young people with the villages has been generally successful.'

In the South African context community service could undoubtedly contribute substantially to overcoming the deep divisions that exist in the society, and could in particular assist in closing the huge gap between higher education institutions and poor communities. The research suggests that for this to occur, reciprocity and mutual respect would need to become

the cornerstones of any initiative whereby higher education seeks to become more responsive to community need. Traditionally many institutions have viewed communities as laboratories for research and a one-way relationship has frequently developed. In building reciprocal relationships, it is essential from the outset that all parties - the community, the institution and the students - are aware that the partnership will be of mutual benefit to them. Without this it is unlikely that the interaction will be a success. Experience in other countries suggests that if the relationship starts on this basis and the commitments are upheld, the relationship grows and far exceeds what was originally anticipated. It may even extend to formal courses being offered by the institution to the benefit of the communities, and research programmes being related to challenging and original problems existing within the community.

Developing systemic support for a culture of service

How then can a coherent system be created which integrates the different functions of higher education with reconstruction and development? How can a culture of service be encouraged and extended?

The research suggests that a system accommodating a diversity of service programmes is likely to have four key features:

- It needs to support a multiplicity of programmes - those that are integral to curricula as well as those that are entirely voluntary;

- It should be organised at different levels (ie. national, provincial, local and institutional);

- It should operate within the framework of agreed developmental priorities; and

- It should encourage institutional and local initiative.

- range of incentives and measures will be required to promote a culture of service within this diversified model

- The National Qualifications Framework provides the vehicle through which experiential learning and service learning can be recognised and accredited. It provides for the recognition of a wide variety of

learning achievements, irrespective of the sites where learning takes place;

- Higher education institutions, in partnership with community organisations, need to take advantage of the provisions in the present tax dispensation which provide incentives for the support of educational endeavour;

- The reward, tenure and promotion systems should provide incentives for staff at higher education institutions to engage in community service activities. For example, criteria for academic staff appraisals could include service-related teaching and research activities;

- Higher education institution admissions criteria could include evidence of service in the relevant field; and

- Opportunities need to be structured into national and institutional financial aid schemes whereby higher education students are able to earn financial credit while contributing to community development.

CONCLUSIONS

The publication of this concept paper concludes an initial phase of exploration. The findings are not definitive and further work will be required before implementation planning can be done. The paper has highlighted a range of issues which will need to be debated in order to develop specific proposals for a national community service programme in South Africa.

As a basis for debate, the paper draws the following conclusions:

l.   Community service is a feature of many higher education strategies which are seeking to respond to societal needs.

Higher education institutions are trying to respond to broad societal needs in a number of ways. This research project examined those strategies for responsiveness in which community service plays a part. In these instances, community service takes different forms such as workstudy programmes, community outreach and extension services, and internships. Most of these programmes are closely related to the mission of the institutions. Some extend the teaching and research activities into new sites and in some cases they generate services to the communities as a function of this extension. These responsive strategies create the opportunity for attracting support - either financial or in-kind - from public and private sector organisations.

2.   The primary beneficiaries in most of these programmes are the institutional stakeholders: students and staff.

The programmes examined hold greatest benefit for institutional stakeholders and in each case the benefit takes different forms. For example, students may benefit from the financial aid they receive in

exchange for their participation in the programme; they also gain work experience, grow in confidence, and develop specific and transferable skills. Many programmes teach students to work independently as well as with other people, and help them acquire life skills such as improved communication, punctuality and keeping appointments.

Participation in the service programmes provides staff with opportunities to make their work more relevant to a transforming curriculum and assists them in generating new knowledge. Some of the programmes offer new opportunities for research and consultancy, both of which may attract private funds from new sources, and this ultimately benefits institutions. In the case of the institutions, some programmes contribute to the development of institutional capacity (especially in the case of the Western Cape on-campus workstudy programmes where students undertake core work within the institution at cheap rates). The programmes also have an impact on the curriculum, they sensitise academics to the need for skills development and the need to bridge gaps between institutions and community activities, and they support affirmative action efforts by helping the institutions to groom their own academics. The programmes facilitate systemic institutional change through the development of partnerships internally and externally.

In examining the benefit of the programmes to the communities they are intended to serve, the research found that the definition of the community shifts from one programme to another. In some cases the term `community' refers to the campus community while in other cases it refers to poor or disadvantaged communities in a particular local area. From the available information it would seem that the programmes are in a position to add value to the communities (as defined in each case), but in the absence of evaluations, impact assessments and the views of the communities themselves, it has not been possible to estimate what impact these services are having on the scale of need. The impression given by the available information is that the impact is small in comparison to the enormous need in most South African communities. For example, the survey of legal aid clinics conducted during this research found that 18 clinics countrywide address less than 1% of the estimated need for legal aid. In the case of the workstudy programmes, however, the value of the services rendered to the institutions (which in themselves constitute the

community for the programmes) could be deduced from the fact that when external funding was reduced, the institutions found the funds from their own budgets to continue the programmes.

3.   Increasing the scale and impact of community service activity depends on establishing a strategic match between resources and needs.

Community service programmes, especially volunteer programmes, are often criticised for operating on a small scale. This limits them to a marginal role in a context where the scale of need is large in terms of services required and human resource development.

The research found that the relationship between scale and impact may be a function of the nature of specific needs and the strategies required to meet them, and the amount of time available for service. If the need requires labour-based activity, then large numbers may make a big difference. If meeting the need requires the application of skill, technology and specialist knowledge, on the other hand, the numbers are likely to be less important than establishing a strategic match between the available human resources and the needs and tasks. Alternatively, the need may best be met by means of an appropriate solution, such as in the case of on-campus programmes which increase the capacity of the institutions.

4.   If community service is to make a major impact on social need in South

Africa, a quantum leap is required from the fragmented services provided. The challenge is to develop a coherent system which accommodates diversity while putting in place incentives and measures to promote responsiveness to national development priorities.

The association of national service with compulsory military conscription under apartheid has led to suspicion of national service programmes. Recent developments in post-apartheid South Africa are giving new meaning and form to the notion of national/community service, and various approaches to community service are being explored both within civil society and within specific government line ministries. This opens up possibilities for public/private partnerships in the funding, design and implementation of community service programmes.

However, South African community service programmes are currently institution-based and locally focused, and operate as a fragmented set of activities which do not relate coherently to key social priorities. The challenge is to develop a coherent system which accommodates diversity while putting in place the incentives and measures through which community service programmes can be encouraged and extended.

The research suggests that a system accommodating a diversity of service programmes is likely to have five features:

- It should operate within the framework of agreed developmental priorities. Most national service programmes in other countries aim for national impact and are organised within different kinds of national frameworks or plans. In South Africa no national framework exists to improve the responsiveness of community service programmes to national needs and to assist in their growth and development;

- It needs to support a multiplicity of programmes - those that are integral to curricula as well as those that are entirely voluntary;

- It should be organised at different levels (ie. national, provincial, local and institutional);

- It should encourage institutional and local initiative; and

- Programme design must be informed by a clear understanding of primary goals and secondary goals as well as by a realistic understanding of what benefits are likely to be gained by different participants.

A range of incentives and measures will be required to promote a culture of service within this diversified model, including:

- The National Qualifications Framework provides the vehicle through which experiential learning and service learning can be recognised and accredited. It provides for the recognition of a wide variety of learning achievements, irrespective of the sites where learning takes place;

- The reward, tenure and promotion systems should provide incentives for staff at higher education institutions to engage in community service activities. For example, criteria for academic staff appraisals

could include service-related teaching and research activities; colleagues, peers and journals could be encouraged to acknowledge community-based work as worthy of recognition so as to develop incentives within the disciplines for the kind of teaching and research that is done; and

- Opportunities need to be structured into national and institutional financial aid schemes whereby higher education students are able to earn financial credit while contributing to community development.

5. External funding is critical for the development and growth of these initiatives.

The programmes are all dependent on external funding. In some cases they also receive financial support from the institutions themselves. This makes their financial base very vulnerable, restricts their scale and inhibits their growth and impact.

The research suggests that increased funds could be sourced in the following ways:

- Individual line ministries may be willing to support certain fields of study, especially where this work includes an element of community service and relates directly to the new human resource needs identified in emerging policy;

- There is already considerable corporate interest in contributing to human resources development to increase the pool of people from whom companies can recruit. The need for specialised skills has attracted corporate funding into certain areas of study (through bursaries combined with internships) and this could be extended to new fields of study; and

- There is evidence of partnerships between institutions and the private sector as well as with parastatal organisations, foundations (both local and overseas) and government departments. This shows that there is considerable interest among different role players in supporting programmes that are more responsive to societal needs, including those in which community service plays a role.

6.   Student financial aid strategies could be boosted by community service.

The scale of the financial aid crisis is such that a diversified financing strategy will be required to generate funds additional to those already going into the national student financial aid scheme. Two strategies have been identified which could supplement a general student Financial aid scheme. Both involve matching financial aid to the achievement of specific outcomes - either skills development or service provision.

- First, financial aid could be channelled to students involved in community activities as part of their study programme, provided a partnership could be struck between the institution and public or private agencies interested in supporting the development of specific fields of study; and

- Second, loan forgiveness could encourage graduates to extend their work in public or community service beyond the time stipulated in the compulsory requirement for professional registration.

In both cases issues relating to cost-recovery will have to be investigated. For example, would community service be regarded as an opportunity for repayment in kind? On this basis a careful cost-benefit analysis would need to be undertaken. Although neither of these strategies facilitates the capitalisation and sustainability of the national student financial aid scheme, they could assist in taking some pressure off the national scheme. The possibility that they may weaken the national student financial aid scheme would have to be carefully weighed.

7.   If community service is to become a feature of development work in South Africa, and higher education in particular is to play its role, the following issues will require further research in order to inform the conceptualisation, policy formulation and planning necessary:

- A cost-benefit analysis is required in terms which quantify the in-kind contribution of community service in South Africa;

- Evaluations and impact assessments need to be conducted of programmes currently in operation in South Africa;

- The impact of the international case studies should be more closely analysed in terms of the local contexts in which the programmes were implemented;

- Establish whether there is a difference in the quality of service provided by higher education community service programmes and service provision in the same field by public and private providers; and

- Explore whether small-scale community service programmes may offer insights for the improvement of mainstream provision.

APPNDIX

COMMUNITY SERVICE PROGRAMMES SURVEYED 1N THE COURSE OF RESEARCH

This appendix documents the programmes involving participants who met or spoke to members of the research team during July and August 1997. The appendix is intended to provide a description of how the programmes operate, what type of programmes they are and how to get in touch with programmes for further information.

The research was conducted on the basis of conceptual model which was helpful in providing a foundation for discussion and analysis. The conceptual model looked at community service programmes in higher education as a matrix of possibilities: earning opportunities for students, learning opportunities for students and staff, and opportunities for developing the notion of community commitment among all institutional stakeholders. Furthermore, the matrix took a broad view of community service in relation to a higher education timeframe and looked at programmes before higher education, during higher education and after higher education. These categories have informed the analysis in section 2 of the paper.

	Before Higher Education	During Higher Education	After Higher Education
South African programmes surveyed and represented on the conceptual model used for research			
Earning	Joint Enrichment Project Youth Work Scheme	Ufundo (University of Cape Town) University of Natal Pietermaritzburg Student Employment Project (Step) University of the North	
Learning		University of North West Leaf College Technikon Witwatersrand Johannesburg College of Education Community Education Programme Peninsula Technikon University of the Witwatersrand Rural facility University of Natal Pietermaritzburg political science 331 University of the Western Cape Technikon Northern Transvaal	SA Graduate Development Association
Community Commitment		Shawco (University of Cape Town) Uskor (Stellenbosch) South African Student Volunteers' Organisation (Sasvo) Wits High School Partnership Programme	

BEFORE HIGHER EDUCATION

The Joint Enrichment Project's Youth Work Scheme
Community-based

Contact: Penny Foley
                The Joint Enrichment Project
                P.O. Box 62024, Marshalltown, 2107
                Phone: (011) 834-6865
                Fax: (011) 834-4955
                Email: JEP@wn.apc.org

The Youth Work Scheme is a project of the joint Enrichment Project. The Youth Work Scheme recruits people aged between 20 and 30 who have not completed their education and are unemployed. A team of 1530 participants works on community reconstruction projects four days a week for six months. Participants attend personal development sessions one day a week. The work scheme ensures that young people gain the discipline and skills required to return to study or to secure employment, while ensuring that communities see youth as a positive resource in the reconstruction of South Africa.

The Youth Work Scheme was initiated in 1995 and now has four teams of 20 students working in the programme. The scheme is initiated in communities after extensive consultations with community representatives. Communities are fully briefed on the purpose and scope of the project and their role in the project is workshopped. Participants in the scheme get paid a monthly stipend for taking part. If they complete the programme they receive a bursary which must be used for further education or training, or to purchase tools or equipment for employment or income generation.

The Joint Enrichment Project has the capacity to expand the Youth Work Scheme to work extensively in Gauteng. The current capacity of the project is to run five to six teams of 20 people annually. The Joint Enrichment Project believes that with the appropriate staff resources that capacity could be doubled to 12 teams of 20 annually. Expansion depends on several factors. From December 1996 the Youth Work Scheme works

only with communities that are able to raise money for the materials necessary for site development. For example, one team is building a church and the church is paying for the bricks and cement. The Youth Work Scheme often needs to play an advisory role to the community in assisting people to raise money for these resources. This aspect of the work has the most limiting effect on expansion.

The Joint Enrichment Project does not believe that establishing and running a national programme is the best method of expanding the work scheme. Rather, it believes that replicating through other structures is preferable. There is enormous potential to expand the work scheme. This could be done in several ways such as through local government, provincial government departments, civic institutions and nongovernmental organisations. The joint Enrichment Project has developed a manual for use by other organisations to facilitate this process of replication.

DURING HIGHER EDUCATION

Leaf College of Commerce and Engineering

Service-learning

Contact: Mr Martin Mulcahy
                 Leaf College vice-principal for planning and development
                 Private Bag $8
                 Rondebosch, 7700
                 Phone: (021) 686-0070 Fax: (021) 686-0182

Leaf College aims to address the needs of students committed to careers in commerce and engineering who have particular abilities in these fields but who have been educationally underprepared through inadequate access to educational resources. Leaf College is a post-matric, residential college in Rondebosch, Cape Town, which enables students with potential to gain access to established technikons, universities and workplace training programmes. There are currently 120 students enrolled at the college from all areas of South Africa, the result being that students with different backgrounds, home languages and cultures can further their studies in an environment of tolerance and mutual respect.

One way in which the college incorporates community service into its curriculum is through its engineering course. Students identify a technology-related problem in their community and design a product to solve the problem. The groups make a model and a technical drawing of the product, write a report and give an oral presentation on the product. The design project enables students to apply what they are learning in the classroom to the real world in the context of helping other people. The project also helps students to develop skills related to thinking, organising, communicating and teamwork. The college, and more broadly, the National Access Consortium Western Cape which is facilitated by Leaf College and represents 26 bridging institutions, is interested in expanding its involvement in service-learning activities as it seeks to increase enrolment in these types of bridging programmes from the current level of 500 to its goal of 4 000 students by 1998. In addition, there are chances in its existing workstudy programme to expand the involvement of students to working in community-based organisations.

Wits High Schools Partnership Programme

Camps-based/Workstudy

Contact: Thulare Bopape
             1 Jan Smuts Avenue
             University Corner, sixth floor
             Braamfontein
             Phone: (011) 716-3204Fax: (011) 716-3402

Wits University is working with 20 black Gauteng high schools in traditionally disadvantaged areas to develop a model for tertiary institutions to follow. The pilot partnership programme has three major goals:
• To prepare high school children more adequately for the workplace and tertiary education;
• To promote student development and increase the success rate of students through improved teaching and learning and coherent academic development programmes; and
• To foster staff development at all levels.

Towards those ends, about 200 Wits students (at the level of third year or honours in their subject) are engaged in tutoring about 25 students

(Standard 6-10) at each of the 20 schools. Students selected in Standard 6 are expected to participate in the programme through to Standard 10. In addition, Wits University staff are providing in-service workshops for teachers and are assisting with upgrading teacher qualifications. With the assistance of Reach and Teach, computers have been provided to five of the schools to establish computer resource centres to enhance learning. Wits students participating in the programme have been receiving financial compensation for their involvement. It is expected that following the programme's recent move to the faculty of education, students will begin to receive academic credit for participating in lieu of financial compensation.

The Wits High Schools Partnership Programme is a sophisticated operation which uses a participatory community-driven process and significant private sector support to engage hundreds of Wits students in assisting with the development of students in 20 black high schools. In examining the potential for expanding their programme, there was a desire to channel more tutors into the same 20 schools to achieve a greater impact instead of expanding the number of schools involved. With the recent involvement of the faculty of education, additional financial resources could enable the programme to expand.

As a pilot project, the high schools partnership programme does provide an interesting model for other tertiary institutions to examine. However, significant institutional, financial, and human resources would be necessary for a particular institution to pursue the development of this type of programme, particularly given the range of partnerships which are crucial for a programme like this to succeed.

The Desmond Tutu Education Trust On-campus avorkstudy

Contact: Ms Thandiwe McLean Executive director
             13 Greenwich Grove Station Road
             Rondebosch, 7700
             Phone: (021) 686-5010 Fax: (021) 686-2278

The Desmond Tutu Education Trust funds workstudy programmes at the five higher education institutions in the Western Cape: University of Cape Town, University of the Western Cape, Stellenbosch University, Peninsula Technikon and Cape Technikon. About 3 000 students receive funding every year for workstudy experiences.

The workstudy programme is an employment project with students employed in academic and nonacademic capacities. Students are employed as tutors, laboratory and research assistants in academic departments, research institutes and centres, and as administrative assistants providing extra infrastructural support in administrative and service departments. Most projects are campus-based, while some have a community-based educational focus. At the University of the Western Cape examples of community-based education projects proliferate in the faculties of community and health sciences, dentistry and the School of Pharmacy.

While the workstudy programme benefits the total academic enterprise, students are the primary beneficiaries of the programme as it is directed at their academic development and their ability to afford fees. There is reciprocity in the delivery of workstudy. Student assistants receive financial aid, and participating students acquire the confidence to confront their lack of preparation for tertiary education. Ultimately it facilitates the progression from undergraduate to graduate programmes, and in so doing addresses national human resource needs. Students are also kept in direct contact with the needs of the greater community and this link helps them to identify more closely with the impact of improved social conditions once they graduate.

The objectives of the workstudy programme are:

•   To provide substantial financial assistance while encouraging co-operative learning among the students;

•   To broaden the academic development programme by enabling students to become actively involved in the learning process and to develop skills to apply the acquired knowledge;

•   To complement the staff component to keep up with the growth in student numbers -a consequence of accessible entrance requirements

- thereby improving the institution's capacity to provide quality education;

- To simulate working conditions to prepare graduates adequately for the work situation, thereby increasing their marketability; and

- To inculcate a culture of work among the students, and instil a sense of responsibility.

Two programmes supported by the Desmond Tutu Educational Trust are described below: one at Peninsula Technikon and the other at the University of the Western Cape.

1. Peninsula Technikon

This workstudy programme is divided into the following categories, each with specific objectives.

Peer group teaching, laboratory, fieldwork and research assistantship: In the face of the phenomenal growth in student numbers, the lack of increased funding, and the concomitant increase in staff workloads, new strategies have been devised to provide students with the individual attention they need to overcome their educational disadvantage. These consist of alternative tutorial programmes which are driven by the students, with a high level of involvement by relevant staff members. In these programmes, groups of students are each assigned to a senior student and follow a programme specially designed for that group by the lecturer. The monitoring process is facilitated by the exercises the students are given on completed work. The senior students are called peer group teaching assistants and are remunerated for their contribution. The same principle applies to laboratory and fieldwork assistants. Here senior students are allocated to small groups in laboratory or field settings during the practical component of a course. The students help reduce the lecturer's load and help him/her to focus on more innovative ways of delivering the course.

Although the mandate of technikons is to produce graduates with high-level technological skills, equipped for the job market, few graduates are absorbed into technikons by way of continued research or teaching. In attempting to address this deficiency, the Desmond Tutu Educational

Trust has introduced a programme in which students are trained and encouraged to do research in specific areas. This is done by opening spaces for research assistants to aid lecturers embarking on various aspects of research such as literature reviews, etc. The students are remunerated at the same levels as the peer group teaching assistants.

Administrative assistantship: The above categories require a certain level of academic competence, and for that reason may exclude many students, particularly first-year students. The administrative assistantship programme targets this group of students. The duties in this category range widely from pure administrative duties like answering telephones, taping and filing to duties relating to distribution of post or monitoring the in-flow and out-flow of people in residences. The main benefit for students in this category is financial, as well as gaining skills related to the duties performed.

In-service training opportunities: The nature of a technikon qualification is such that the student should complete a period of experiential training before qualifying, particularly in the technology fields. The unemployment rate in the country has a direct and negative impact on the process of students being placed with companies for experiential training. The workstudy programme provides an opportunity for placing students in the institution's own laboratories, which are of the same standard as those in industry, or better. These trainees are to be employed for part of an academic year and are remunerated on a monthly basis.

Orientation: The Peninsula Technikon has had to move into lice with other institutions in requesting up-front payment for tuition and boarding fees. This often has to come from parents/ students since none or very few bursaries have been confirmed by this time, and many students are unable to afford these fees. With this in mind, the technikon is using the registration period to employ some students part-time, both in an administrative capacity and in programmes that assist the `new' students in the transition from secondary to higher education. The orientation committee has already put such programmes in place, while the Desmond Tutu Educational Trust assists with remuneration for the student assistants.

Peer helpers: The student affairs department together with the student representatives' council will identify ways in which students who have gained experience in student structures can be employed to support newly elected members.

Library information service: The Desmond Tutu Educational Trust workstudy programme has played a constructive role in providing labour to the library information service which operated under severe staff shortage constraints over the years. Some dedicated students were employed to facilitate this function and they also had a chance to earn an income for personal and tuition expenses. At the same time students were exposed to the demands of the real working world under the mentorship of the library information service.

Implementation and management: Each department participating in the programme, is required, via the director of the school concerned, to submit a detailed programme for consideration. The programme starts at the beginning of the academic year and proceeds throughout the year for about 30 weeks. The programme is evaluated at quarterly intervals by the coordinator with the lecturers and/or section heads concerned. The group leaders are remunerated, and 60% of the money due to them is deducted and paid towards meeting costs for their fees. In the process they also acquire new skills, including confidence and a better understanding of the course involved. As far as possible black women, particularly those from rural areas, are given priority in becoming involved in these programmes. Two mechanisms are employed in recruiting students into the programmes: advertising across campus, and active methods which involve identifying financially needy students through the financial aid office.

The programme is managed by the programme coordinator who reports to the vice-rector. An office has been established as an infrastructure for the programme and is financed to a large part by the technikon. There is cooperation in the running of the programme with other technikon departments such as the financial aid office which helps identify needy students, and the cooperative education department which helps find suitable placements for students. Interest has also been expressed by the student counselling department. Financial management is exercised by the programme coordinator in conjunction with the finance department.

2. University of the Western Cape

A number of community outreach projects have been initiated by the dentistry faculty, the School of Pharmacy and other departments in the health sector.

The community dentistry department uses student assistants for two of its projects. The Eros project is focused on preventative health, and is directed towards improving the oral hygiene of scholars at the Eros School for Cerebral Palsied Children, The students participating in this programme have become involved with the Eros children in more than just the provision of oral health care. They have, for example, organised an annual fun-day since 1994.

The denture project, based at a clinic in Guguletu, was established to provide a free denture service to the elderly in Guguletu, Langa, Nyanga and Khayelitsha. Historically dental services were not extended to this community and the demand for dentures is phenomenal. While the conditions under which students provide the service are less than ideal, the opportunity has resulted in a swifter development of skills in prosthetic dentistry. The project has also highlighted the plight of pensioners in disadvantaged communities.

The School of Pharmacy introduced a community-orientated pharmacy asthma project to investigate the potential for using pharmacies and community pharmacists to improve the identification and management of asthmatic patients who visit pharmacies for medication. Not only has this project evolved as an answer to a need expressed by community pharmacists, but it has also proved to be a valuable vehicle for exposing undergraduate students to aspects of pharmacy practice.

The Western Cape community partnership project focuses on interdisciplinary community-based health worker education. Faculties and students from the health sector at the University of the Western Cape and Peninsula Technikon are beneficiaries and participants in this programme. While the Kellogg Foundation sponsors this programme, some of the infrastructural needs regarding monitoring and implementation at departmental level are met by student assistants. This is also an example of interinstitutional cooperation.

Projects in nonacademic departments

The successful functioning of the academic departments is totally dependent on an efficient administrative system. Although the university experienced steady growth in student numbers from 1986 onwards, this was not equalled by an increase in administrative support staff. The employment of student assistants has played an important role in strengthening infrastructural support and enhancing the efficiency of administrative support structures. While academic departments are obliged to prioritise academic excellence above the financial needs of students, a significant number of students are employed in the nonacademic sector, where financial need is prioritised in selection. This ensures equity in the distribution of trust funds.

Administrative assistants: In many administrative functions - such as registration, processing of marks and preparation of brochures - permanent staff receive essential support from administrative assistants who receive financial aid in return.

Management information systems: In management information systems courses, student assistants support lecturers in the presentation and monitoring of students' performance when applying the theory to the practical use of computer and accounting software. The assistance is vital in enabling lecturers to make practical work accessible to a much larger number of students.

Computer laboratory assistants: These students help to keep the computer laboratory open at night to accommodate the needs of students who require access to this facility.

Support for institutes and centres: As is the case at the Peninsula Technikon, student assistants at the University of the Western Cape provide a valuable service to many administrative and support departments at the university The service includes processing application forms for university admission; assisting in the registration office with data capturing, and so forth, both at the start of the academic year and during the year; helping in the financial aid office with filing, data capturing, sorting of application forms and assisting at the inquiries desk; providing assistance

in the records section by filing and maintaining student files; and working in the finance department.

Students employed through the workstudy programme also help to provide support functions in most of the university's institutes and centres (such as the Institute for Social Development, the Centre for Adult and Continuing Education, the Education Policy Unit and the Gender Equity Unit). In the course of their involvement in these centres they often develop incisive research skills.

University of the Witwatersrand Rural Facility

Campus-based/Service-learning

Contact: Mr John Gear
Executive director
Private Bag X420
Acornhoek, 1360
Phone: (015) 793-3991 Fax: (011) 793-3992

The mission of the Wits Rural Facility best summarises the purpose of its work: Wits University should through a permanent presence in a typical rural area create a multidisciplinary and interdisciplinary endeavour which will contribute to the development of such areas; inform society of rural needs; provide a venue for experiential community-based learning for postgraduate and undergraduate students from a spectrum of facilities; and alert Wits graduates to the challenges and rewards of working in such a rural area. This will ultimately benefit not only the immediate communities but South African society as a whole on an ongoing basis, through the service, research, advocacy and policy making of the students and staff who are participants in and products of the rural facility's endeavour.

The Wits Rural Facility is involved in numerous projects which employ about 40 full-time staff and involve many different Wits departments. For example, the occupational therapy department runs a training course for community-based rehabilitation workers in conjunction with the Tintswalo Hospital rehabilitation unit. The rural facility provides accommodation for students and their trainers, runs some training sessions

on community development topics, and has helped to evaluate the programme. Mechanical engineering students have contributed to this project by designing and building low-cost walkers for local disabled people.

Three distinct features make the rural facility's work unique:

• There is a permanent Wits University presence in Mpumalanga;

• The rural facility's staff are interdisciplinary; and

• The facility provides a mix of teaching, research and service.

The most significant challenge facing the rural facility is the lack of sustainable funding for its projects. While the rural facility's activities need to be expanded, the funders have tended to establish short-term projects with a focused impact. With additional sustainable financial resources, the facility could expand its capacity dramatically.

The rural facility also provides an interesting model for other institutions to examine because it provides a mechanism for students studying in an urban community to focus their work on rural needs. The major barrier to developing additional interdisciplinary facilities further in other institutions will most likely be a lack of financial and human resources.

The University of the North

National Community Water and Sanitation Training Institute

Contact: Dr A. Shaker
Executive director
National Community Water and Sanitation Training Institute
c/o University of the North
Private Bag X1106 Sovenga, 0727
Phone: (0152) 268-3266   Fax: (0152) 268-3263
email: ncwsti@pixie.co.za

The institute was opened in 1996 with the primary aim of working within the community water and sanitation sector. Its goal was to standardise training and influence tertiary education with a view to engaging more students in programmes contributing human resources to the sector.

The institute is currently negotiating with the university to help it establish an agriculturalist generalist programme focusing studies on engineering and rural development. It is anticipated that the institute will play a significant role in developing the curriculum for the programme, teaching courses on environmental science, and facilitating the placement of students in community-based work experiences in the water and sanitation sector. The institute receives its funding from the Irish government and the Water Research Commission. It is based at the University of the North which provides in-kind office space.

Technikon Northern Transvaal Mechanical engineering programme

Contact: Mr P G Van Niekerk
             Executive director
             Technikon Northern Transvaal Foundation
             PO. Box 313
             Parklands, 2121
             Phone: (011) 880-8090 Fax: (011) 880-6003

The goal of the project was to form a joint venture to develop a mobile spaza - a small shop or workshop run by entrepreneurs in the informal business sector. In essence, the project entailed designing a vehicle for handicapped people which could be built and serviced inexpensively by local, black-owned backyard autobody shops in the township of Soshanguve, where the technikon is located. Under this programme, senior mechanical engineering students, guided by their mechanical engineering lecturer, have built a proto-type model and will work to design the mobile spaza. The students on the project will be divided into four teams - suspension and steering, platform and superstructure, engine and power pack, and control and electricity. In this service-learning project, students will be challenged to take what they were learning in the classroom and apply it to the real world in the context of helping other people.

The tecknikon has hired a full-time coordinator for the project. It is also anticipated that partnerships will he developed with private sector engineering and auto manufacturers to donate in-kind support for the mobile spaza. Thirty students will participate in the project, which is partly financed by the Ford Foundation. The department of mechanical engineering was approached by the Medunsa Organisation for Disabled Entrepreneurs Project to form a joint venture for the development of a mobile spaza. The Technikon Northern Transvaal Foundation submitted a proposal to the Ford Foundation to support this endeavour.

The institution is quite involved in the project through its mechanical engineering department and the project has been incorporated into the curriculum. The project is about 18 months behind schedule because of the challenge of finding an appropriate full-time coordinator for the project. The coordinator was hired recently and the class is expected to start soon.

The University of the North West

Service-learning

Contact: Dr G. Humphrey
             Project leader
             Water Research Commission
             Private Bag X2046
             Mmabatho
             Phone: (0140) 892-050   Fax: (0140) 892-052

The University of the North West was designed to involve all its faculties in the development of the university's surrounding community. The purpose of involving students is to give them practical work experience and to expose them to community issues. There is no overall project coordinator but community service is compulsory for students and is completed in different ways. For example, one of the projects of the chemistry department which involves 25 students in service-learning has three goals:

•   To perform a chemical and biological analysis of rural water supplies in the Molopo region of the North West Province;

•   To correlate the analysis results to the health of community members and disease profiles; and

- To run intervention and education programmes for the 12 villages in the region.

The water project is a partnership between the University of the North West and the Water Research Commission. It operates in the province and creates the linkages between research, teaching and community service which allow the university to be responsive to the broader community's needs.

Technikon Witwatersrand

Campus-based/Service-learning/Workstudy

Contact: Mike Mailula
     Community projects officer
     PO. Box 17011
     Doornfontein, 2028
     Phone: (011) 406-2512 Fax: (011) 406-2283

The Wits Technikon has involved more than 120 students in a campaign to improve the standard of living and quality of life in disadvantaged communities through about six different projects. The technikon's mission provides for community-outreach programmes which are supported by academic departments and coordinated by a community projects officer. The private sector provides a significant amount of resources for the project's core activities, and students can receive bursaries, academic credits and in some cases money for taking part.

The amount of time students work in the programme differs from project to project. In some projects, students spend an average of one day a week doing community service while others participate during technikon holidays. Some examples of the technikon projects include:

- A water purification project in Pilanesberg,

- A health clinic in Alexandra used by taxi drivers and commuters;

- Fine art education in disadvantaged communities;

- Computer literacy programmes for teachers;

- Peer tutoring programmes for matric students; and

- Bridging programmes for post-matric students.

Given the basic infrastructure that exists to support this community development programme, expanding student involvement in these projects would require the appropriate resources to build the staff infrastructure (there is currently only one full-time staff member) and the funds necessary to support the projects. However, given the institution's previous acknowledgement of the importance of experiential education and community development work, the process of further institutionalising the programme is constrained primarily by the lack of financial resources. There is also a willingness on the technikon's part to share knowledge with other tertiary institutions about its work and to embark on joint ventures.

University of Natal Pietermaritzburg Student Employment Project (Step)

Workstudy

Contact: Dr Phumelele Ntombela-Nzimande
Head, Student Employment Project
University of Natal Pietermaritzburg
Private Bag X01 Scottsville, 3209
Phone: (0331) 260-5870   Fax: (0331) 260-5741

The project started in 1991 with the following aims:

- To develop a mentoring relationship between academic staff members and students to break down barriers created by decades of the apartheid system in general and by apartheid education in particular. This relationship would be built while working with a student on a research project;

- To encourage students to do community work. Their participation in the community would result in an interactive relationship between the university and its surrounding communities, thus laying the foundations for a two-way partnership;

- To provide role models who would encourage and help first-year students to overcome their learning difficulties; and

- To supplement needy students with their fees and general income.

The workstudy programme is one component of Step's activities and enables students to work either as interns (working with a staff member), or as a student mentor in a peer-tutoring programme under a staff supervisor.

Interns work for 90 hours either as an academic researcher or as a community intern. Students are given a `living allowance' and receive part payment into their fee accounts. These payments are made biannually, once the work has been completed. Each intern and his or her staff mentor attend a joint compulsory introductory workshop at the beginning of the year where new participants learn from the experiences of those who have already taken part in the programme. This is a vital part of the programme because it reflects on past problems, how they have been overcome and the experiences gained from the programme. Community interns work with off-campus organisations under the same conditions as the academic research interns. Contracts are drawn up for participants.

The student mentors undergo intensive training workshops over three days, have six-weekly reportback meetings and have the coordinator attend at least one of their mentoring sessions. A certificate is presented to all participants and this is added to their CVs. Programme evaluations are conducted periodically to accommodate the changing demands within the programme.

Financial support and larger impact

In 1991 the internship programme, as it was called then, was made possible when the Ford Foundation, the Canadian embassy and Kelloggs provided funding. The Ford Foundation still funds the student stipend aspect of the programme. The university finally took responsibility for the programme's running costs and staff salaries in 1995. Step is located within the university's student services unit and this has made it an integral part of the student development function at the university.

In 1992, the integration of internships as a credit-bearing course was piloted by the theology department. Curriculum change was brought about through knowledge gained from research in townships and squatter camps. The information obtained has been used to improve the training of priests who go back into these communities. This is a growing project in the

theology department. An off-shoot from community internships was a pilot study set up in the political studies department in 1996 where students were required to put in 40 hours of community work as part of their course work.

Another student-driven initiative is the now-established learner driver project. The students realised that without drivers' licences they would not be able to access the areas easily in which they were training to work. The students collected money and a university cost account was opened for them. This snowballed and after much negotiation with the Minister of Transport, the traffic department and driving schools, BP donated a car and R60 000 for students to obtain their drivers' licences. To date 30 students have acquired these licences.

Internship programmes have resulted in students being offered employment in the departments where they have been interns. Mentoring relationships have helped to identify potential in students that would otherwise have gone unnoticed, role models have been provided for other students, career paths have been identified and students offered employment because of the specific experience gained in the internship programme. The university has also been made aware of the inadequacies that exist for visually impaired students on campus. Other changes that previously went unnoticed have been identified through having visually impaired students in the programme; for example, building construction is demarcated in such a way as to provide a safe passage for those who cannot see.

In 1995 the initiative was taken to open the programme to all races. This highlighted areas where previously advantaged students were disadvantaged. Some students had never ventured into the townships and were horrified to find out the conditions in which old people had to collect their pensions. Other students were too afraid to go into small business areas that were not historically white.

Students have benefited from part-time employment opportunities organised through Step and this has resulted in a successful partnership between the university and employers. The programme has also helped the university to think on a long-term basis about developing partnerships internally and externally, so as to achieve a paradigm shift in the university's role beyond research, teaching and learning. The KwaZulu-Natal Midlands

partnership on the Pietermaritzburg campus is well under way, engaging with the Education Department and other stakeholders on their stance on further education. In this way the university is using its resources to help address `the leak in the educational pipeline' through the community college network envisaged by the partnership programme.

The University of Natal Pietermaritzburg

Service-learning

Political science 331 – citizenship and community service

Contact: See page 124.

This class was created to `encourage students to think about and encounter issues pertaining to citizenship by a combination of coursework and an internship with an approved community partner'. The internship is spread over a semester and requires a minimum of 40 hours of voluntary community service in governmental or nongovernmental work. The focuses on researching and understanding the role of citizenship in a democratic society, working in the internship and reflecting on those experiences through a journal and in class discussion. Students are also required to complete a final report and presentation to de in the major themes from the class with the work experiences they had. The class is taught by Prof Ralph Lawrence and Phumelele Ntombela-Nzimande is the course coordinator, facilitating the placement of students in internships through the student employment project. There is potential to replicate these types of opportunities on other campuses provided there is a faculty member interested in this subject and someone who that person can work with to facilitate student placement.

Johannesburg College of Education Community Education Programme

Service-learning

Contact: Ms Penny Tyawa
                    Johannesburg College of Education
                    27 St Andrews Road
                    Parktown, 2193
                    Phone: (011) 642-7373   Fax: (011) 643-6312

The Johannesburg College of Education's Community Education Programme is an integral part of the curriculum for students at the college. All college students are required to complete 20 hours of voluntary community service and to submit an assignment which represents the theory underpinning the practical component. Last year 160 students completed the programme. Examples of the types of projects include:

• A series of workshops to promote social and physcial development;

• Tutoring projects in maths, English and science;

• A lifeskills programme (conflict resolution) at Vezukhomo Community School; and

• A variety of literacy and adult basic education projects.

The aim of the community education programme is to take students outside the classroom situation and into the real world where they can apply what they have been learning to help others. Students are typically placed as individuals with organisations to develop and coordinate projects. Funding for the programme is provided by Standard Bank. The Johannesburg College of Education serves as an excellent example of the way in which community service can be thoroughly integrated into the curriculum to enhance learning and to imbue a sense of civic responsibility.

Ufundo Workstudy

Contact: Mr Kabelo Kale (Director: Administration)
                  Students' Union
                  University of Cape Town
                  Rondebosch 7700
                  Phone: (021) 650-3843   Fax: (021) 650-2904

Ufundo stands for the Ujima Fundraising Organisation. Ujima means `collective work and responsibility', and encapsulates the essence of the programme. Ufundo is a student-initiated organisation at the University of Cape Town which was founded in 1995 in response to the student financial aid crisis. Although there is an established financial aid office at

the University of Cape Town, it is unable to meet student demand for financial assistance. The rise in the number of needy students has meant that few students receive full assistance. As a direct result, this threatens to Emit access to tertiary education. Ufundo aims to provide bursaries for 1 000 students and 500 emergency loans for other students over the next five years.

Ufundo's mission is:

- To increase access to tertiary education by easing the financial crisis experienced by most students from disadvantaged backgrounds; and

- To encourage student independence by proactively ensuring that all students involved in Ufundo gain life skills that enrich tertiary education by making it a form of education for life.

Ufundo believes that South Africa will be able to take great strides in developing previously disadvantaged communities only if skilled citizens work in those communities. Ufundo beneficiaries are therefore required to reinvest their skills in development projects. Ufundo is currently operating four community service projects:

- A computer literacy project affiliated with the computer science department and Anderson Consulting;

- A tutoring programme;

- An AIDS awareness project; and

- A nature awareness and environmental conservation project. Ufundo was established as a partnership between many sectors of the University of Cape Town, including the student affairs department, the financial aid office and the vice-chancellor. These partnerships will be critical if Ufundo is to succeed in its fundraising efforts. There is tremendous potential and need for expanding the Ufundo programme and that is precisely what the players are trying to do over the next five years. This model - which links bursaries to community service - is the type of programme that could be replicated at tertiary institutions countrywide given the appropriate institutional, financial and community resources.

The Southern African Student Volunteers' Organisation (Sasvo) Campus-based

Contact: Prof Christof Heyns

The Centre for Human Rights Faculty of law

University of Pretoria Pretoria, 0002

Phone: (012) 420-3810   Fax: (012) 434-021

Sasvo was established in 1993 by the Centre for Human Rights at the University of Pretoria as a nationwide programme which enables students at all universities, technikons and colleges to work as volunteers with established community service organisations during their holidays. Their most recent project, Operation Zenzele (`Do it yourself'), was held during the winter holiday and engaged more than 300 higher education students working on a major school renovation and human rights education campaign in over 50 Gauteng secondary schools. Other organisations that were partners in the project included the Gauteng education department, the Congress of South African Students, the Pan African Students' Organisation and the Nelson Mandela Children's Fund. Operation Zenzele was aimed at enabling tertiary and secondary education students to take joint responsibility for reconstructing a healthy and humane community life on the basis of the new constitution.

With a recent grant from the United Nations Development Programme, eight recent tertiary education graduates will be hired by the United Nations Volunteers to work for Sasvo as regional coordinators for the project. These fieldworkers will enable the latter to increase its presence on campuses countrywide. Given the appropriate financial resources, Sasvo is well-positioned to expand its operations to engage more students in community service, and to serve in the long term as a clearinghouse for student organisations which are looking to plan community service projects over their holidays.

The Students' Health and Welfare Centres Organisation (Shawco)
Campus-based

Contact: Andile Blaii or Charles Ainsley
                    President and president-elect
                    Glen Truran, director
                    155 12th Avenue Kensington, 7405
                    Phone: (021) 593-2170   Fax: (021) 593-3815

Shawco was founded in 1943 by a small group of University of Cape Town medical students. They began a small night clinic in Windemere, then a squatter community. Since then Shawco has grown to be the largest student-initiated welfare organisation in the country employing 40 fulltime staff and using about 600 student volunteers.

Shawco has expanded from its traditional health focus to include a wide range of welfare and education services provided from seven community centres in chronically underserviced squatter camps and townships around Cape Town. Specific projects run by Shawco include:

- Mobile health clinics operated by University of Cape Town medical students;

- The Shawco tutorial education programme which provides tutorial classes for 500 Std 9 and Std 10 children in Khayelitsha, Langa and Gugulethu;

- The Shawco HIV and AIDS resistance programme (Sharp);

- A nutrition programme feeding 8 000 pre-school and 30 000 primary school children each day;

- Economic development programmes; and

- An adult education programme for learners in night schools.

Shawco believes it is important for its projects to be driven by community needs. Most full-time staff based in the centres are hired from the local community and the long-term goal is for the centres to become self-sufficient community operations. As a student-driven organisation,

students are integrally involved in all aspects of programme planning, development and fundraising activities. All student members of Shawco are volunteers. Typically students volunteer for a particular project and are trained in both the principles of Shawco and the skills they need for that project. The Shawco student president and two vice-presidents coordinate and liaise between all sectors of the organisation.

The organisation does not wish to expand its operations unless this is accompanied by sustainable funding. With sustainable funding, however, there is significant potential to expand programmes offered by Shawco's community centres, some of which are not staffed by full-time employees. Extra full-time employees will be able to provide greater services to the community and will help to create opportunities for placing additional volunteers.

Shawco is an interesting model for tertiary education because it focuses its energy on community needs and relies on student leadership to harness the enthusiasm and idealism of students to make a difference to the surrounding communities.

University of Stellenbosch Clinics Organisation (Uskor) Campus-based

Contact: Lydia Burger
Volunteers' coordinator
Private Bag Xl
Matieland, 7602
Phone: (021) 808-3841   Fax: (021) 886-5441

Uskor is the student service organisation of Stellenbosch which provides the organisational framework for student participation in community service and development. Uskor's purpose is to address the service and development needs of communities with effective and legitimate programmes which involve students and the university's knowledge and expertise. Uskor was founded in 1964 as a clinic service for the disadvantaged. Today, more than 250 students and eight full-time staffers are involved in service delivery and development projects including:

- Entrepreneurial development and job creation endeavours;

- Primary health care programmes;

- Youth development programmes;

- Adult basic education and training; and

- A community resources programme.

Uskor uses the university's financial systems and office space but is an independent service and welfare organisation. Community and student governance of projects is also an important component of Uskor's work. AFTER HIGHER EDUCATION

The South Africa Graduate Development Association

Community-based

Contact: Vukile Nkabinde President
PO. Box 1144
Johannesburg, 2000
Phone: (011) 630-7896   Fax: (011) 630-7951

The association is an organisation serving unemployed graduates from universities, technikons and colleges. It was founded by and is managed by formerly unemployed graduates. It has three goals:

- To create employment and internship opportunities for unemployed graduates;

- To encourage graduates to be involved in self-employment and community development initiatives; and

- To lobby and network on behalf of unemployed graduates to raise awareness about the situation, and to communicate the value that can be added in developing communities by using their skills.

The graduate development association was created to fill a gap in service provision, particularly because there were no after-study/post-tertiary

programmes for former students to assist them in developing the skills needed for further employment. The association still has difficulty raising money for its programmes but has significant potential to address the needs of recent graduates. Given the appropriate resources, it is prepared to expand its operations. In addition, the association has received requests to bring these types of programmes to other institutions.